



GAPS ANALYSIS STEERING COMMITTEE

FINAL REPORT

October 2007



INTRODUCTION

Alternatives for increasing access to post-secondary education and training programs has been debated intensely since the passage of the Pennsylvania Community Colleges Act of 1963.

On November 30, 2006, The Erie Community Foundation invited Sandi Vito, Deputy Secretary for Workforce Development, Pennsylvania Department of Labor, to moderate a public forum on this topic.

Interest within the media, employers, civic leaders, elected officials and educational providers was great. Ms. Vito encouraged the community to establish a “Gaps Analysis Committee” to study the issue and to propose the right solution to the right problem.

The Erie Community Foundation agreed to convene this committee. Funding for the committee consultant was provided by the Pennsylvania Department of Labor. This report is the conclusion of their work since first convening in February 2007.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Erie Community Foundation Board of Directors, for supporting this process

Erie Community Foundation Staff:

Mike Batchelor, President
Amy Cuzzola-Kern, VP of Programs

Erie Regional Chamber & Growth Partnership:

Mary Bula, Executive Director, Erie Growth Partnership
Michael Pistone, Intern

Members of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee:

Michael L. Batchelor, Erie Community Foundation
David Bauer, Esq., Warren County Commissioner
Steve Bishop, Corry Higher Education Council
Mark DiVecchio, County Executive
Jane Earll, Pennsylvania State Senator, 49th District
John Elliott, Executive Director, Redevelopment Authority
The Honorable Phil English, U.S. Representative, 3rd District
Thomas J. Gamble, P.h.D., President, Mercyhurst College
William Hilbert, PHB, Inc.
Bill Jeffress, Executive Director, Booker T. Washington Center
John Krahe, NW PA Manufacturers Association
Bill McCarthy, CEO, Stairways, Inc.
Sandra Myers, Superintendent, Union City Area School District
The Honorable John E. Peterson, U.S. Representative, 5th District
Jim Ryan, Decision Associates
Joan Stitzinger, Warren/Forest Higher Education Council



Members of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee (continued):

Patty Stubber, Executive Director, NW PA Area Health Education Center
David Tullio, Custom Engineering
Ronald Wilga, Public School Administrator, Retired
Michele Zieziula, Executive Director, Workforce Investment Board

Mercyhurst College

Mercyhurst Interns:

Andrey Allakhverdov
Andreea Neagu

Mercyhurst Intern Supervisors:

Robert Heibel
William Welch

Erie Highmark Office Customer Service Department, for their assistance with the
Capacity Research

Table of Contents

Gaps Analysis Steering Committee 1
 FINAL Report 1
 Acknowledgements 2
 Executive Summary 8
 1. SETTING THE CONTEXT 11
 1.1. It was no longer an option to do nothing because of demographic issues in the region such as educational attainment, household income, population and economic growth of the region..... 11
 1.2. Purpose of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee 13
 2. Process and accomplishments of Steering Committee 14
 A. Occupational demand data did not match the experience of the Steering Committee members..... 14
 B. Capacity analysis seemed incomplete and inconclusive..... 15
 C. Data was too narrowly focused 16
 3. Criteria for Assessing the options 17
 A. Brain Gain 17
 B. Flexible 17
 C. Low-cost 17
 D. Portable 17
 E. Geography..... 17
 F. Quality 17
 G. Permanency 17
 H. Branded Product 18
 I. Economic Development Tool 18
 J. Cost to the Community 18
 K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds 18
 4. Description of Options..... 19
 4.1. Challenging local colleges and universities to better serve the region. 19
 A. Brain Gain 19
 B. Flexible 19
 C. Low-cost 20
 D. Portable 20
 E. Geography..... 20
 F. Quality 20
 G. Permanency 20
 H. Branded Product 20
 I. Economic Development Tool 21
 J. Cost to the Community 21
 K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-Secondary Matching Funds 21
 4.2. Help Precision Manufacturing Institute (PMI) move north 22
 A. Brain Gain 22
 B. Flexible 22
 C. Low-cost 22
 D. Portable 22
 E. Geography..... 23

F.	Quality	23
G.	Permanency	23
H.	Branded Product	23
I.	Economic Development Tool	23
J.	Cost to the Community	23
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-Secondary Matching Funds	23
4.3.	A Regional (Multi-County) Branch Campus Model.....	24
A.	Brain Gain	24
B.	Flexible	24
C.	Low-cost.....	25
D.	Portable	25
E.	Geography.....	25
F.	Quality	25
G.	Permanency	25
H.	Branded Product	26
I.	Economic Development Tool	26
J.	Cost to the Community	26
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds	26
4.4.	A New, Free-Standing Community College.....	27
A.	Brain Gain	27
B.	Flexible	28
C.	Low-cost	28
D.	Portable	28
E.	Geography.....	28
F.	Quality	28
G.	Permanency	28
H.	Branded Product	29
I.	Economic Development Tool	29
J.	Cost to the Community	29
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds	29
4.5.	Enhance Supportive Services (Child Care/Transportation) and Financial Aid (Vouchers) to Attend Existing Providers.....	30
A.	Brain Gain	30
B.	Flexible	30
C.	Low-cost	30
D.	Portable	31
E.	Geography.....	31
F.	Quality	31
G.	Permanency	31
H.	Branded Product	31
I.	Economic Development Tool	31
J.	Cost to the Community	32
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds	32
4.6.	Help Mercyhurst NE Fulfill the Role of a Community College.....	33

A.	Brain Gain	33
B.	Flexible	33
C.	Low-cost	33
D.	Portable	33
E.	Geography.....	34
F.	Quality	34
G.	Permanency	34
H.	Branded Product	34
I.	Economic Development Tool	34
J.	Cost to the Community	34
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds	34
4.7.	Invite Existing Community College to Create Presence in the Region.....	36
A.	Brain Gain	36
B.	Flexible	36
C.	Low-cost	36
D.	Portable	36
E.	Geography.....	37
F.	Quality	37
G.	Permanency	37
H.	Branded Product	37
I.	Economic Development Tool	37
J.	Cost to the Community	37
K.	Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds	37
5.	Conclusions	38
5.1.	Process for Reaching Recommendations	38
A.	Challenge local colleges and universities to better serve the region.....	38
B.	Help PMI move north.....	38
C.	Enhance Supportive Services (Child Care/Transportation) and Financial Aid (Vouchers) for Students to Attend Existing Providers.....	38
D.	Help Mercyhurst NE Fulfill the Role of a Community College	39
5.2.	Top Three Options	39
A.	Adopt a Regional (Multi-County) Branch Campus Model.....	39
B.	Invite Existing Community College to Create Presence in the Region.....	40
C.	Create a New, Free-standing Community College.....	41
5.3.	Final Decision.....	41
A.	Recommendation	41
B.	Driving Arguments.....	41
C.	Steering Committee’s Concerns and Caveats	42
5.4.	Next Steps.....	42
6.	Appendices	43
6.1.	Excerpt from June 2007 Progress Report	43
	Purpose of Steering Committee	43
	Strategy/Work Plan.....	43
	Meetings to Date	44
6.2.	List of Regional Programs	47
6.3.	List of Interviewees.....	51



6.4.	Inventory of Reports	52
6.5.	Educational Attainment Comparisons	54
6.6.	NPTI Audit Report	55
6.7.	Letter from Mercyhurst College	57
6.8.	Inventory of Post-secondary Training and Education Capacity in the Region.	60
7.	Endnotes.....	82

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In the course of a community meeting in November 2006 to discuss the region's quest to create a community college, the Deputy Secretary of Labor and Industry (DLI) for the Commonwealth, charged the community with addressing the right problem with the right solution. The community was challenged to conduct a gap analysis to identify the need that a community college would fill and DLI offered to help however possible.¹ The Erie Community Foundation (ECF) agreed to serve as convener of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee – a group of individuals in leadership positions representing several different counties, government, education, economic development, workforce and the non-profit/community development sectors. The Department of Labor and Industry agreed to fund a consultant (**Public Works LLC**) to facilitate the process, assist with the research, and write the Committee's report.

The Gaps Analysis Steering Committee embarked on a mission to identify the best and highest use of the community's resources (revenue, taxes, leadership, capacity, land) to address three basic goals:

- Meeting employers' current and future needs for skilled workers
- Improving educational attainment and household income
- Making Erie a more attractive place for businesses to stay or to relocate

The Committee directed staff on a course of research into occupational demand, supply, and education and training capacity to better understand the region's needs and ability to meet those needs. Ultimately they found, however that the issue was not a matter of precisely quantifying and defining occupational demand, or assessing the quality and capacity of existing post-secondary education and training in the region. The real issues were multifaceted: affordability to students, employers, and the community, and an accessible system of education and training that can adapt to the region's changing needs.

The Committee's recommendations are based on compelling circumstances in Northwestern Pennsylvania. It is no longer an option to do nothing because of declines in educational attainment, household income, population and economic growth of the region.

- In 2006, Erie's per capita income had decreased to 79.7 percent of the U.S. per capita income, the lowest point since 1969.¹
- The percent of adults in the U.S. 25 years and older in 2005 with an Associate's degree or less but some higher education was 27.4 percent for the U.S.² For Pennsylvania statewide, the figure was 22.3 percent, clearly below the U.S. average. However, even more disturbing is the fact that all the counties in NW PA fall below the statewide average, except for Mercer County (23.5 percent).³
- In the Northwestern Pennsylvania (NW PA) region, 67 percent of high school graduates go on to college versus 72 percent for the state overall.

¹ Erie Community College Meeting, Erie Club, Erie, PA, November 30, 2006, notes page 7.

- College-bound graduates in NW PA are far less likely to enroll in a community college than graduates across Pennsylvania (2 percent v. 16 percent).⁴ This could be due in part to the absence of a community college in the region.
- One study shows that a community college education increases earnings for workers by 31 percent (2007)⁵ Program completers increased earnings by \$6,628 immediately after graduation (pre-post).⁶ For community college students in Nebraska, every full time year attended increases earnings an average of \$4,188 per year.⁷
- From 1995 to 2000 nearly 27,000 people moved into Erie County during the five year period, but nearly 32,000 moved out for a net *out* migration of 1.7 percent (loss of 4,791).⁸

Based on the research and the analysis and evaluation of several different options, the final recommendation of the Committee is to create a Northwest PA community college as a free standing regional community college with the invitation to the other counties to co-sponsor with Erie, and with an opportunity to have branch campuses. Other counties could, but would not have to participate financially. Should the other counties choose not to participate financially, the tuition rates for residents of those counties would be different – two-thirds the cost instead of one-third the cost for sponsoring counties.

As the Committee debated the strengths and weaknesses of the top three options, three basic concerns rose to the surface and became the driving arguments in favor of a stand-alone regional community college: 1) affordability to the student, 2) creating a centralized education and training system, and 3) having a governance structure in place that was first and foremost concerned with meeting the community's changing needs with regards to post-secondary training and education. As one member emphasized, when the virtues for comparing the options was described, "mission" or alignment with the communities' priorities should be key – "Is it the mission of this entity to serve this region and to do the things we want to do here?"

In addition to the final recommendation to create a new, free-standing community college, the Committee includes the following recommendations and caveats to guide the region's work moving forward:

- This new school must remain flexible, even to the point that it may need to respond to the needs of each county or a specific community.
- The invitation must be extended to the other counties, i.e. "We're on the ground floor and we would like to invite you to participate."
- At the end of the process, even if no other counties participate, Erie County should move forward.
- Create industry advisory groups to keep the community college relevant and able to meet industry changing needs.
- Program diversity is important; both academic and technical programs are needed.

- The data collection system needs to be fixed so that the community college can address community needs. There are data collection methods with some refinement – BREP, WIB, Industry Partnerships – that could be more relevant.

The state formal process to create a new community college includes receiving written approval by the Governor of Pennsylvania and assurance that the funding will be available, clearance of the application by the Pennsylvania Department of Education, and approval by the State Board of Education. The approval and start up process takes approximately two years; the last time a new community college was created in the state was in 1991.

The application is a complex and detailed document requiring not only careful planning, but detailed projections of demand and enrollment over several years. Start-up funding will be required for preparation of the application, as well as for preliminary faculty and administrator contracts to prepare the college to open its doors.

The current County Executive has pledged funding for start up, has developed a detailed business plan, and has approached the Steering Committee to move the process forward. It is hoped that the business community, through the Growth Partnership division of the Erie Regional Chamber & Growth Partnership will also play an important leadership role in moving this issue from discussion to reality.

1. SETTING THE CONTEXT

It is important to understand the context within which the Steering Committee came together to discuss the need for a community college in the region.

1.1. It was no longer an option to do nothing because of demographic issues in the region such as educational attainment, household income, population and economic growth of the region

Ever since the passage of the Pennsylvania Community Colleges Act of 1963, when the State of Pennsylvania first offered communities the opportunity to create and sponsor public community colleges,⁹ the community has discussed and debated whether or not to expand post-secondary training and education opportunities in the community, in cooperation with surrounding counties.¹⁰ The conversation had intensified recently, as is evidenced by several different reports issued by economic development, workforce development and education groups within the region since 2003.¹¹

The intent of the original community college legislation passed in the early 1960s was to establish a state-wide network of institutions distributed across the state. This has not been realized in Pennsylvania as demonstrated by the existing network and regions identified as underserved.

- When the community colleges were created by statute in 1963, the original vision was for 28 colleges to serve every region of the state. Currently, Pennsylvania community colleges have 47 campus sites, 43 off-campus sites, and 93 other sites resulting in 42 of the state's 67 counties being served in some capacity.¹²
- Erie (Northwestern Pennsylvania) is one of five regions in the state with virtually no access to community colleges and has correspondingly low shares of workers with education beyond high school.¹³

The Gaps Analysis Steering Committee began its work in February 2007 as the Erie Community Foundation was completing its work on a major study of poverty in the County. The study found that lower educational attainment always results in lower earnings/wages and higher rates of poverty, that per capita income in Erie is lagging the state and the nation, and disparities between Erie, state and nation are growing larger. Some of the most compelling facts brought to light by the Poverty Study include:¹⁴

- Income in Erie is growing more slowly than national rates, meaning that Erie County income is falling further behind the national income level. U.S. per capita income is \$36,307 compared to \$28,941 in Erie County.¹⁵
- Erie has continued to fall farther and farther behind the national average income level. After its peak of 96.6 percent of U.S. per capita income in 1974, Erie's per capita income has not kept pace with U.S. per capita income. After a slight rise in the late 1980s and early 1990s, it again resumed its slide relative to the national average.¹⁶

- In 2006, Erie's per capita income had decreased to 79.7 percent of the U.S. per capita income, the lowest point since 1969.¹⁷
- From 1989 until, 2000, the poverty rate in Erie was consistently below that of the U.S. (and PA). From 2001 to 2005, Erie's poverty rate was either above or equal to that of the U.S. In 2004, the poverty rate was 1 percent higher than the poverty rate of the U.S. (13.7 percent compared to 12.7 percent)¹⁸
- From 2000 to 2003, there was an 11 percent increase of individuals living in poverty in Erie County.¹⁹
- Approximately 62,407 individuals in the county (23.5 percent) lived in households with incomes less than 150 percent of the poverty threshold. (One hundred fifty percent of the poverty threshold equals an income of \$23,366 or less for a family of three and \$29,967 for a family of four.)²⁰

All data and outcomes on educational attainment indicate one prevailing conclusion: Erie and the NW PA region have comparatively low educational attainment. The region is experiencing educational attainment trends that could no longer be ignored:

- Twenty-seven percent of the adults in the U.S. 25 years and older in 2005, have an Associate's degree or less but some higher education²¹ For Pennsylvania statewide, the figure was 22.3 percent, clearly below the U.S. average. However, even more disturbing is the fact that all the counties in NW PA except for Mercer County (23.5 percent) fall below the statewide average.²²
- The facts demonstrate a significant number of students in Erie County and to a larger degree in Erie City are not pursuing higher education anywhere near the levels found in Allegheny and Butler Counties, where there are low cost community colleges.²³
- In the Northwestern Pennsylvania (NW PA) region, 67 percent of high school graduates go on to college versus 72 percent for the state overall.
- College-bound graduates in NW PA are far less likely to enroll in a community college than graduates across Pennsylvania (2 percent v. 16 percent).²⁴
- Non-college bound graduates from NW PA most often choose to pursue careers in the military (17 percent v. 12 percent), and blue collar (21 percent) or service (20 percent v. 15 percent) sectors.²⁵

Poverty is highly correlated with inferior educational outcomes; therefore, there is a significant impact on Erie's economic development if, on average, it has lower levels of educational attainment than Pennsylvania (PA) and the U.S.. Conversely, a community college education increases earnings. Studies show:

- An Illinois community college education increases earnings for workers by 31 percent (2007)²⁶
- Illinois community college graduates employed full-time averaged \$32,369 in annual earnings after completing their programs of study. This represents about 250 percent of the state's minimum wage.²⁷ Program completers increased earnings by \$6,628 immediately after graduation.²⁸

- For community college students in Nebraska, every full time year attended increases earnings an additional \$4,188 per year.²⁹

Concerns about “brain drain” in the region compounds concerns about declining income, increases in poverty, and lagging educational attainment. Erie County has recently lost population. During the five year period from 1995 to 2000 nearly 27,000 moved into Erie County, however nearly 32,000 moved out for a net migration loss of 4,791 or 1.7 percent.³⁰ A study of Penn State Behrend students indicated that 260 of the 960 Erie County students graduating from the program between 1994 and 2002 no longer resided in the county in 2003; a 27 percent brain drain of Erie County residents attending a local college

The Steering Committee recognizes that Erie County is only one of several counties that constitute the northwest PA region, however, it is the population center of the region and, as such, its income, poverty and educational attainment characteristics must be given significant consideration. Other counties considered part of northwest PA for the purposes of this study include: Clarion, Crawford, Forest, Mercer, Warren and Venango counties.

1.2. Purpose of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee

Once the Steering Committee fully embarked on its work, three major goals emerged through the course of several meetings designed to identify and prioritize the ideal impact on this region of the efforts of the Committee and expanded post-secondary education in the region:³¹

- Meeting employers’ current and future needs for skilled workers
- Improving educational attainment and household income
- Making NW PA a more attractive place for businesses to stay or to relocate

The task for the Committee was to identify the best and highest use of the community’s resources (revenue, taxes, leadership, capacity, land) to achieve these three goals.

2. PROCESS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS OF STEERING COMMITTEE

The Gaps Analysis Steering Committee (Committee), a group of individuals in leadership positions representing several different counties, government, education, economic development, workforce and the non-profit/community development sectors, came together for the first of six meetings February 23, 2007. The Committee received a Progress Report in July 2007 describing the data gathered in response to the questions.³²

- What is the demand for skills currently and in the future?
- What is the skilled supply in the seven-county region?
- Is skill supply adequate to meet demand?

The findings from the Progress Report generated energetic discussion from Steering Committee members. In the course of subsequent committee meetings, individual interviews and emails, members raised several valid issues resulting from their review of the report and discussion of the data. These issues are discussed below.

A. Occupational demand data did not match the experience of the Steering Committee members

The discrepancy between the state's data and the experience of Steering Committee members led the research team to probe the data more deeply and ask, "What's missing?" This led to exploration of other sources of data and information, such as the Business Retention and Expansion Program (BREP) data collected by economic development agencies and the NW PA WIB 2001 study conducted by Strategy Solutions. These reports were compared to the Center for Workforce Information and Analysis (CWIA) data collected by the PA Department of Labor & Industry.

Table 1 below, showing the difference in CWIA annual projections covering 2004-2014 and NW PA Workforce Investment Board data for 2001-2006, both covering the counties in NW PA, illustrates the difficulty in defining current and future demand.

Table 1. Projection of Average Annual Openings for Occupations Requiring More than High School Diploma but less than Bachelor's degree

Occupational title	CWIA (2004- 2014)	Strategy Solutions (2001-2006)
Cooks & Food Preparation Workers	215	367
Material Moving Workers	134	15
Office Clerks, General	130	17
Registered Nurses	112	217
Bartenders	63	145
Licensed Practical & Licensed Vocational Nurses	57	150
Maintenance & Repair Workers, General	54	7
Nursing Aides, Orderlies, & Attendants	52	668
Bookkeeping, Accounting, & Auditing Clerks	46	9
Welders, Cutters, Solderers, & Brazers	23	151
Machinists	22	99
Hotel, Motel, & Resort Desk Clerks	10	107
Computer Support Specialists	10	37
Computer Programmers	8	44
Substance Abuse & Behavioral Disorder Counselors	4	46

The BREP analysis provided some interesting demand information by industrial category; however, because the BREP information was not broken out by specific occupation it was not possible to compare the BREP figures with the CWIA and Strategy Solutions figures.

B. Capacity analysis seemed incomplete and inconclusive.

The analysis of existing regional post-secondary training and education capacity was incomplete at the time of the July Progress Report. This was due to several factors:

- The NW PA workforce system was not fully incorporated into the preliminary analysis of existing capacity, especially in terms of vendors on its Eligible Training Provider list. These vendors must meet certain criteria to be placed on the list and be eligible to receive state and local training funds.
- Further analysis of the cost of programs at various providers showed that the cost figures were not always accurate, and needed to be corrected.
- Steering Committee members had significant anecdotal information illustrating the problems of accessibility to post-secondary training and education for local residents despite the presence of training providers and educational institutions. Obstacles to accessibility fell into the consistent themes of location (geographic accessibility), tradition (preconceived notions of what was

available),), and cost. Also, the ability of existing training programs to adequately meet employers' current and future training needs was a significant concern..

- Data was not available on common indicators of quality (graduation rates, placement rates, impact on wages) for all providers. The lack of data made it difficult to discuss the quality of the training and education capacity in the region to determine if this was an issue and if so, to what extent.
- The preliminary analysis lacked information regarding course transferability and articulation agreements among providers and any discussion of why or why not such agreements could be developed.

The research team worked to address most of the concerns regarding existing capacity. The detailed information can be found in the appendices. In summary, the research found that there exist 42 different certificate and 48 associate degree programs in the region; in the case of an Associates in Liberal Arts, the same program is offered by as many as seven different providers. LPN/LVN training is offered by four different providers. (See the detailed chart in the appendices for specific information.) Once the cost figures were refined, it was discovered that only the Edinboro University and GECAC programs in the region, however were offered at almost twice the cost of a community college full-time program.

Ultimately, the issue was not a matter of poor quality or capacity. The real issue was multifaceted: affordability to students, employers and the community, and an accessible system of education and training that can adapt to the region's changing needs.

C. Data was too narrowly focused

Steering Committee members expressed concern along four themes. First, the occupational demand data focused on the 'here and now' and did not speak to the aspirations of employers, or the community's vision for evolving the economic base for the region. Second, the occupational data focused almost exclusively on current employers' needs and did not address the larger issues of educational aspirations, educational attainment and improving household incomes of local residents. Third, the capacity data spoke to current capacity and not to what is needed to attract new businesses to the region as well as to continue to 'grow our own.' And finally, the data's meaning was subject to wide interpretation, from indicating there is not a need for additional capacity to the belief that a community college could play an integral role in meeting existing and future needs.

3. CRITERIA FOR ASSESSING THE OPTIONS

Before any options can be objectively and uniformly assessed, it is critical to first define the criteria or design principles deemed most preferable by the Steering Committee. During the discussions between February and July 2007, several criteria or design principles emerged. These are described below. Each option was discussed and evaluated as potential solutions to the three major goals – 1) meeting the current and future needs of the region’s employers, 2) improving household income and educational attainment levels in the region, and 3) making the region a more attractive place for companies to locate – will be evaluated in light of these criteria.

A. Brain Gain

The attraction and retention of trained and talented individuals to the region, as expressed in the number and educational attainment of individuals age 25-64.

B. Flexible

The ability to adapt to changing demand and changing circumstances to meet the unpredictable needs of the future.

C. Low-cost

Affordable to individuals in lower income households.. The benchmark to assess options was set as the average community college tuition and fees across Pennsylvania -- currently \$2,850 per year.

D. Portable

The classes taken are for credit, are transferable to other institutions, and build towards a portable, nationally-recognized certificate or associate’s degree.

E. Geography

The physical location and public transportation options to the education or training location makes it accessible to many parts of the region. This also speaks to the ability of the model/option to deliver programming around the region.

A possible benchmark may be similar to New York community colleges that typically serve a fifty mile radius.³³

F. Quality

The education and training provided meet quality standards set by state or regional accrediting bodies.

G. Permanency

The solution is structured to be sustainable over several generations.



H. Branded Product

The solution can be packaged as a recognizable, valuable, easily described product that the region can offer and that inspires residents and non-residents to take advantage of the product.

I. Economic Development Tool

The solution has successfully been leveraged in other communities to attract and grow businesses.

J. Cost to the Community

The solution optimizes the community's financial contribution through state matching funds and/or directly affects the greatest possible number of individuals.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

The solution meets the criteria outlined in Pennsylvania statute and rules to qualify for state funding as a community college.

4. DESCRIPTION OF OPTIONS

The options included in this discussion are ideas that surfaced during individual interviews conducted in July and August. The list of interviewees can be found in the appendices.

4.1. Challenging local colleges and universities to better serve the region.

There are four colleges, several proprietary schools and other miscellaneous training providers in the region. One recommendation considered was to leverage the existing capacity by creating some means to pool existing expertise and capacity to better meet the needs of the region. Individually and uncoordinated, the existing capacity is lacking the combination of attributes or design principles identified as critical; however, in combination there is the potential for offsetting individual weaknesses through a collaborative approach.

In other states, the formalized version of this collaboration is a multi-institutional teaching center which is governed by a board separate from the individual participating institutions but with representatives from each.

For NW PA, this type of collaboration would have to be established in a way as to not duplicate the operational structure of the Northwest Pennsylvania Technology Institute (NPTI) -- where courses were provided through contracts with existing providers, making NPTI a “community college without walls.” The major weaknesses of this structure are presented in the subsequent audit report (see excerpt in appendices).

A. Brain Gain

Increasing the number of post-secondary educated people in the region could expand existing capacity and provide an opportunity to increase the educational attainment of the population, making it easier for individuals to enhance their education by staying in the region. However, a collaborative effort would probably not draw additional students from outside the region to take advantage of the education and training. It is unlikely that the offerings would be so unique as to draw students in from other states or regions.

In addition, existing training and education providers have not historically reached out to middle-performing students from low-income households who have limited ability to leave the region and insufficient resources to afford a private college education. These students require remediation and services to help them succeed; they also have limited debt capacity.

B. Flexible

The need for multiple institutions to cooperate in the planning and delivery of courses poses a significant challenge in remaining flexible enough to meet changing needs. To date that collaboration has not happened and all indications are that it will be a significant challenge to do so.

If decision-making can happen quickly to expedite resources shifts and redeployments to respond to unanticipated circumstances, then this option could meet the regional need for flexibility. Once an occupational market is saturated, the collaboration must be able to move resources and shift into others with demonstrated current and future demand.

C. Low-cost

One of the weaknesses with existing capacity is that none of the providers offers post-secondary education and training at the same cost as the average community college tuition and fees. Therefore, it is difficult to determine at this point how a collaboration of existing providers would result in lower-cost offerings without substantial underwriting from state and local funds.

D. Portable

If, as a result of meaningful collaboration, articulation agreements could be established across education and training providers in the region, then this option certainly would meet the portability standard. To date, this has not happened; however, in a more formalized collaborative arrangement it is possible. The colleges are accredited by the same body – Middle States Association of Colleges and Schools -- so their offerings should be transferable. However, the non-profit training providers and for-profit schools are accredited by a different standard – ACCSCT (Accrediting Commission of Career Schools and Colleges of Technology) so their offerings are not easily transferable to the Middle States accredited colleges.

E. Geography

Because this option includes existing providers throughout the region and does not rely on a single location, classes could be offered at a variety of locations, assuming there is space available.

F. Quality

All of the participating providers in the collaboration could be required to be ACCSCT or Middle States accredited as a form of quality assurance. This collaborative approach could rely on a variety of quality standards regarding student services, retention, and national certification for non-degree programs.

G. Permanency

Two keystones of permanency and sustainability are funding and governance. The collaborative approach would have to involve the commitment of an ongoing revenue source, prudent management, and a strong and committed governing board to continuously coordinate the participating schools and colleges.

H. Branded Product

A collaborative approach can exist as a branded product if it has a distinct governance structure, is identified as an entity in its own right and has a distinct and appropriate name. If not structured as a distinct entity, and exists as a series of invisible agreements that allow for greater transferability between providers, it will be difficult to easily name and identify the program in economic development marketing literature.

The region has tried a similar approach before, through NPTI and later CAMTech. These efforts failed for a variety of reasons, creating a stigma for any sort of similar effort for many years to come. Reestablishing a collaborative model will require overcoming the stigma of a collaborative approach or a “community college without walls” approach.

I. Economic Development Tool

A collaborative effort is not as easily identifiable to existing and potential employers as a community college in its own right. However, if properly structured, marketed and operated to create a seamless and affordable system of easily accessible education and training for the region, it could still serve as an important economic development tool.

J. Cost to the Community

The investment required to create and sustain a collaborative effort across existing training and education providers is difficult to quantify. The cost could range from zero to some amount needed for office and classroom space, equipment, supplies and staff to transform the collaboration into a more concrete series of programs.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-Secondary Matching Funds

Unless a collaborative effort existed as a stand-alone operation, it would not be eligible for accreditation and therefore, would not qualify for any state higher education matching funds.

4.2. Help Precision Manufacturing Institute (PMI) move north

PMI – Precision Manufacturing Institute – is a private non-profit technical training institute founded about 20 years ago by a group of businesses who needed assistance with training; it is accredited under ACCSCT. At the time, the businesses were looking for an accelerated program because they were not able to wait the two years for students to complete associate degrees. At present PMI has 29 articulation agreements with high schools and colleges in the region. Students can earn up to nine credits from high school and apply those credits to a 2- or 4-year degree. Students must have a high school diploma or GED to be admitted to PMI. PMI serves mostly adult students, with an even split between day and night classes. The majority of PMI's students come from within a 40-mile radius of the City of Meadville in Crawford County.

A. Brain Gain

PMI is drawing mainly from the local population so they are not importing students per se. Since they mainly serve students within a 40 mile radius, they are helping to enhance the educational attainment of adults in the region, especially those who are not traditional students.

B. Flexible

PMI offers programs on flexible schedules, and has managed to continuously respond to the needs of employers in the region, as is demonstrated through their 65 percent increase in enrollment in the last three years and a 98 percent placement rate. PMI's arrangement with machine wholesalers contributes to their ability to remain current. Manufacturers install their latest machines and software at PMI facilities to allow various companies to test and train on the equipment through PMI. This provides PMI with updated equipment on which to teach students enrolled in its programs.

C. Low-cost

PMI programs range in cost from \$5,725 to \$19,875, still at least twice as high as the average community college tuition and fees. Because of PMI's ACCSCT accreditation, students are eligible for federal Pell grants, however they are not eligible for PHEAA grants. Dislocated workers meeting certain criteria are referred from the local Workforce Investment Board and can use their Individual Training Account funds to pay tuition. In addition, many companies pay to send employees through PMI.

D. Portable

PMI has developed a series of articulation agreements; however, PMI is not Middle States accredited as an institution; and their programs are not ABET – Accreditation Board for Engineering and Technology – accredited (educational programs in applied science, computing, engineering, and technology programs at regionally accredited schools). Therefore, their courses are not typically transferable to all the traditionally academic institutions in the region, namely Mercyhurst, Gannon, and Penn State Behrend. PMI has agreements with Edinboro University, Clarion University, Kent State University, California University of PA and Butler County Community College to accept their credits towards Associates degrees. PMI does not offer the core academic

curriculum, but instead is focused on technical training. This has been a conscious choice to avoid competing with institutions with which they have articulation agreements.

E. Geography

PMI is based in Meadville at their Regional Technology and Education Center; in the past, they had offered some courses in Erie.

F. Quality

PMI maintains small class size, in most cases approximately seven students per instructor. Its placement rate is near 98 percent.

G. Permanency

PMI has been in business for 20 years; in 2006 they opened a new facility in Meadville.

H. Branded Product

PMI's marketing materials show PMI to be a branded product; however, the brand is of a private training institute and not a publicly-funded college.

I. Economic Development Tool

PMI's training is focused on manufacturing businesses in the region and could serve as a tool for attracting businesses in that sector. However, PMI may not be as useful a tool to attract businesses outside the manufacturing sector, such as healthcare sciences.

J. Cost to the Community

PMI currently receives no state or local funds to operate. Unless the community chose to provide support in the form of publicly-supported facilities or publicly-funded scholarships, there would be no cost to the region's taxpayers for expanding PMI into Erie County.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-Secondary Matching Funds

PMI is not eligible for state post-secondary matching funds because it is a privately-owned technical training institute. Expanding PMI into Erie County would not result in additional state funds flowing to the community to support post-secondary education.

4.3. A Regional (Multi-County) Branch Campus Model.

In July/August 2006, the Erie County Technical School released a proposal to create a Technical Community College for Northwest Pennsylvania (College) to fill the void for public associate degree technical training in the region. School districts would serve as local sponsors and provide in-kind contributions of staff and facilities through each of the six career technical centers across the seven counties. This follows somewhat the model for four other community colleges in PA that are sponsored by local school districts. The governing board of the college would be a 15-member Board of Trustees as called for in the Pennsylvania School Code. Membership would represent a cross section of the region as well as business, industry and education. The proposed college does not include a central hub, but instead would operate through a series of branch campuses. It is envisioned as a system rather than a college.

There is precedent in Pennsylvania for school district sponsorship of a community college. For example, at Harrisburg Community College, the tuition is set at two-thirds the cost (instead of the typical one-third), so if a resident of one of the sponsoring school district attends, the Community College bills the school district for the sponsor's portion of the student's tuition and charges the student the remaining portion.³⁴

A. Brain Gain

The existing secondary Career Technical Centers across the region are known to serve low-performing students. In fact, about 35 percent of the students at these centers are classified as low performing.

According to Dr. Aldo Jackson, Director, Erie County Technical School, the CTCs across the region send over 40 percent of their graduates onto postsecondary education. Between 1,500 and 2,100 high school students have access to the program through dual enrollment. Most of these graduates are leaving the area to pursue post-secondary plans. The CTCs also enroll over 1,300 adults in continuing education courses. Several of the CTCs operate licensed practical nursing programs.³⁵

B. Flexible

With 40 school boards acting as sponsors of the college, quick, consensus decisions may prove challenging, especially since school facilities would house the college. Any changes to those facilities would have to be approved by the individual school board. Given that current capacity is limited (room for an additional 400 students during the day) and that the smallest community college in the state enrolls over 1,000 students, additional facilities beyond the current CTCs would probably need to be identified to accommodate this model.

In addition, some logistical challenges are present when blending post-secondary students and faculty with secondary students and faculty in the same facilities sharing vocational/technical space in the daytime and evenings. These challenges can most likely be addressed; however, the resolution will probably result in special limitations.

C. Low-cost

The Technical Community College is envisioned to be a public community college, and therefore eligible for one-third funding from the state. As a community college, the tuition would meet the affordability criteria; however, each school district would be required to support the college with cash that is clearly and carefully documented to show that it is not part of the school district's state funds for K-12 programs.³⁶ Local support from the school districts cannot count towards the local share unless districts are able to demonstrate that there was no intermingling of state funds and district funds used to support the technical community college. The expectation is that the majority of the school district contribution will be in actual funds, not in-kind contributions. This would probably require a special mil levy on an existing tax base to create a distinct, verifiable source of funds.

D. Portable

Unless the College is Middle States accredited, it will be difficult for students to transfer their courses to bachelor degree programs. However, by being ACCSCT accredited, there is the potential for credit earned to transfer to other Community Colleges, such as Jamestown in NY and Butler County. Many of the secondary programs are aligned with and accredited by recognized national industry groups. These accreditations provide for student certifications which translate into portability.

E. Geography

The branch campus structure means that there will be a College presence in nearly every county in the region, making this model the most geographically accessible of any of the models discussed in this report.

F. Quality

Because such a large portion of the students currently served by the CTCs are low performing, and because school districts do not invest in CTCs as if they were a priority causing machinery and facilities to become obsolete, there may be some skepticism about the quality of post-secondary offerings through the CTC system. Fifteen of the 19 existing programs are accredited by a national agency. The "system" would need to achieve ACCSTC accreditation as well.

Dr. Jackson provided the following information regarding quality.

In terms of quality and standards, it should be noted that three of the CTCs are registered to the ISO 9001:2000 standard—a standard of quality easily understood by business and industry. The Mercer County Career Center is accredited to Middle States. The Erie County Technical School is accredited to the Pennsylvania Postsecondary Vocational Education standards (a recognized USDOE accrediting standard). Four of the CTCs offer LPN programs that are accredited by the National League for Nursing Accrediting Commission.³⁷

G. Permanency

School districts are more or less permanent; therefore it would be hoped that a College that is based on school districts would have permanency. The history of how well school

districts would maintain state-of-the-art vocational-technical programs is not strong for the region. As envisioned, the community college would be based on dual enrollment and co-enrollment and would not compete with CTCs for funding from the school districts. Rather, it is envisions that they would be one in the same—sharing resources rather than competing for them.

H. Branded Product

While the concept has a title – Technical Community College for NW PA – the lack of a central hub may make the product difficult to brand and market.

I. Economic Development Tool

The CTC model's strength is its structural links to the secondary vocational-technical education system. Many businesses are attracted to the seamless system of vocational-technical education from high school through post-secondary training. They are looking for cooperation across the educational spectrum as an assurance that the pipeline for skilled workers has few leaks.³⁸

J. Cost to the Community

The taxpayers residing within the sponsoring school districts would need to provide some additional funding to meet the state's requirement for local support. The cost to taxpayers is dependent upon the number of residents in the sponsoring boundaries, the extent of the programs and services, the number of branch campuses, and amount of allowable "in-kind" contribution (facilities, equipment).

Total assessed value across the *eight*-county region is \$15,561,334,750. A one mill levy across the region would produce \$15,561,335. A one-quarter mill levy would produce \$3,890,334 *assuming all school districts in the eight counties participated as sponsors of the college.*³⁹

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

Unless the CTC branch campus model can be Middle States Accredited, with the necessary faculty, programs, library, facilities, student services and missions, it will not be considered a state community college, and therefore, would not be eligible for state matching funds as a state community college.⁴⁰

4.4. A New, Free-Standing Community College

This option is the classic vision most people have when they hear the term “community college.”

Community colleges were founded over 100 years ago to provide more accessible post-secondary education closer to home to all sectors of the population. Community colleges award two-year degrees and certificates. A typical community college has the following basic characteristics:⁴¹

- Lower cost of attendance compared to public universities
- Customized programs to meet local/regional needs
- Variety of missions within a single community college:
 - Remedial, adult basic education, and not-for-credit classes
 - Traditional academic core courses, transferable to 4-year institution
 - Vocational certificates and Associate degrees
 - Customized job training
- Over 50 percent of attendees are age 22 or older (16 percent are over 40)
- 60 percent of enrollees attend part time.
- 45 percent of all first-time graduates attend community colleges.

Pennsylvania’s community college law was passed in the early 1960s and the funding comes from state appropriations, local appropriations, and student tuition and fees.

The Erie County Executive has proposed building a free-standing community college for Northwest Pennsylvania (NWPA), with its own independent governing board, open to residents of other counties with possible co-sponsorship with other counties. The local share of funding for Erie County would be provided through anticipated gambling revenues to the County. The current vision is for the community college to serve the multiple missions of: 1) academics, such as core curriculum transferable to four-year bachelor degree programs; 2) non-credit customized job training for local employers on a fee basis and non-credit courses of interest to residents (e.g., remedial classes, conversational French); 3) certified Associate degree and certificate programs, based on course credits that are transferable to other programs and institutions. The broad proposal envisions linking public transportation routes to the campus as well as providing student support services through a variety of means. The vision includes the training and support services of something resembling the Bidwell Center in Pittsburgh.

A. Brain Gain

By their nature, community colleges are designed to serve the local community within which they operate. This means a NWPA community college would not draw many students from outside the region, unless it was able to attract regional students now traveling to Jamestown Community College in NY or Butler County Community College. As discussed earlier in this report, however, evidence exists that community colleges can help improve the educational attainment levels of adults in the county or region who are not mobile enough to seek post-secondary educational opportunities elsewhere.

B. Flexible

Traditional academic institutions tend not to be very flexible or adaptable. Faculty are unionized or tenured, so if resources need to be shifted from one program to another and faculty positions reduced, there is typically significant resistance. This can be managed to some extent through adjunct or part-time faculty. Traditional community colleges, however, can be very flexible and can also maintain industry advisory councils to help plan each year's curriculum and program offerings. They also can employ staff who manage customized training for interested firms or clusters of firms. Most importantly, a community college that embraces a mission of responsiveness to community needs will find a way to incorporate that responsiveness into its operating and governance structure.

C. Low-cost

The free standing community college in NWPA is envisioned as a public community college supported by state and local funds, and therefore would be able to offer its programs within the existing range of tuition and fees as other community colleges across the state.

D. Portable

Courses would be transferable to other Middle States accredited institutions if the college obtains Middle States accreditation and can enter into articulation agreements with other colleges.

E. Geography

The proposed college would be built in Erie County though probably not in downtown Erie. The community will need to be mindful of transportation access to residents of the region both inside and outside Erie County. Interest in co-sponsoring a regional community college has been expressed by Warren County officials. Such a model might be possible if other counties are able to identify and commit a funding source. At least one other community college in Pennsylvania has expanded outside its original county – Harrisburg Community College.

F. Quality

There is no information to assess the educational quality of the proposal because there is no pre-existing institution upon which a community college in northwest PA would be built,. Community colleges are accredited by such institutions as Middle States or national certification or accreditation (such as ABET) for specific programs and certificates. In addition, a NWPA community college could choose to establish performance criteria for which it is willing to be held publicly accountable such as retention rates, articulation rates, and job placement rates of students,.

G. Permanency

A bricks-and-mortar college with a strong governing board, state and local funding, responsive course offerings, and regional accreditation should be able to withstand demographic and economic changes in the region.

H. Branded Product

Community Colleges are universally identifiable post-secondary education and training entities. Literature developed for site location, the real estate market and education, workforce and economic development literature all discuss community colleges. It is a widely recognized term that is easy to brand and with broad-based awareness. There are examples of such branding across the country with some states or cities hosting highly recognized (and recognizable) community colleges, such as Dallas County Community College District or North Carolina's community college system.

I. Economic Development Tool

Economic development magazines, such as *Site Selection* and *Expansion Management*, not only discuss the presence of community colleges in prospective locations as an asset, they track legislation affecting the ability of community colleges to offer training and education to local and prospective employers. Therefore, it stands to reason that an NWPA community college could serve as an economic development tool for the region.

J. Cost to the Community

The cost to the community would depend on the size and scope of the community college. Based on an analysis of 2005 revenues, the average local share to a community is about \$895 per enrolled student (part-time plus full-time) across Pennsylvania's community colleges. Based on this average, a college enrolling 1,000 students – Pennsylvania Highlands Community College has the smallest combined enrollment in the state at 1,324 – would cost the community approximately \$895,000 per year.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

This model would be eligible for state funding because it envisions a Middle States accredited, free-standing community college approved by the Governor and meeting the State Board of Education and the Department of Education requirements with regards to local share, mission, services, faculty, libraries, facilities, etc.

4.5. Enhance Supportive Services (Child Care/Transportation) and Financial Aid (Vouchers) to Attend Existing Providers

Improving accessibility to existing training and education opportunities is a recurrent theme in discussions of whether or not northwest Pennsylvania needs a community college. Accessibility has many facets: affordability, cultural access, geographic proximity, and the time to spend away from other responsibilities, such as child care and work. Along those lines, one option to improve accessibility is not to add to the current training and education capacity, but to provide vouchers or financial aid and supportive services such as child care and transportation.

A. Brain Gain

According to research in workforce development and observations from local education leaders, the two biggest obstacles to improving the educational attainment of under-skilled, underemployed individuals is transportation and child care. No matter how willing individuals are to take out loans and work multiple jobs to pay for education, if they are not able to obtain care for their children while they are at work or school, they cannot succeed at school. Along those same lines, if individuals cannot afford to own and maintain a car, they must rely on public transportation to get to schools and jobs outside their neighborhood and if local bus routes are inadequate, individuals cannot consistently attend classes or get to a job.

B. Flexible

Child care could be tailored to the needs of the community through annual contracts. Transportation routes for the local mass transit system could be added (as they were for certain large employers in the county over the years). The rules for vouchers could be refined to be responsive to students' needs by the appropriate governing body. In any case, none of these efforts is as challenging as changing curriculum or expanding locations for education and training providers.

C. Low-cost

Financial aid such as Pell grants help make post-secondary education more affordable, however, they do not cover the full cost of education. Working students with families and mortgages may not have the debt capacity to take on educational loans to close the gap between grants and their own ability to pay for educational expenses. Individuals with poor credit records may not be able to obtain affordable students loans, much less have the capacity to repay the loans. Erie County and the region have several public and private post-secondary education providers; however, the cost of education at these local schools and colleges is two to seven times more expensive than attending a public community college. Vouchers to subsidize the cost of education to bring it closer to the average cost of attending a community college could be offered to select classes of individuals and could even be targeted towards certain occupations.

Because these are services and not community college programs, no state educational funding match would be available.

D. Portable

The County Council could determine how portable the financial aid, child care, or transportation “vouchers” are; choosing to limit them to certain institutions or courses of study. Unlike transferring credits, there is no built in obstacle to the use of vouchers at a particular college or school, therefore, a student could transfer to another school or program without losing the voucher – the voucher goes with the student not the program.

Child care and transportation services are typically place-bound and not necessarily tied to a particular school if offered through the community rather than through specific colleges.

E. Geography

The location and availability of services and vouchers would most likely be dependent upon which counties contribute funding. There would be no impact on the location and availability of post-secondary training and education programs.

F. Quality

Support services and vouchers would have little or no impact on the quality of existing post-secondary education and training programs.

G. Permanency

Support services and vouchers would most likely be tied to annually-funded contracts. Hopefully, there would be a commitment to provide supportive services and vouchers for the full course of a program; however, cost increases for education could result in fewer vouchers being made available over time. The same holds true for the number of child care slots made available. Service contracts would probably be let on an annual basis, further diminishing the permanency of this particular option.

H. Branded Product

There may be a way to bundle the support services and vouchers into a marketable product. For example, the Kalamazoo (Michigan) Promise financial aid program has become a major marketing tool for the town; in fact families are moving to Kalamazoo to become eligible for the Kalamazoo Promise. The Kalamazoo Promise guarantees free or reduced in-state public college tuition and fees to students graduating from Kalamazoo schools. If packaged appropriately, services and vouchers could become widely known and desirable, inspiring residents to pursue post-secondary education and training.

I. Economic Development Tool

Support services and vouchers would most likely be targeted primarily to current residents who are under-skilled and underemployed. However, the services could be packaged and touted to prospective businesses as a means for training and retaining skilled workers.

J. Cost to the Community

The cost to the community of providing vouchers or financial aid, as well as supportive services such as child care and transportation, depends upon how much the community already is spending, how many of the individuals currently receiving support would choose to attend post-secondary education and training, and the amount of the financial aid and expanded support services the community would choose to fund. Education and training programs in the region cost from \$4500 to just over \$20,000 per year. Federal student financial aid, such as Pell Grants, and institutional financial aid can bring those costs down somewhat.

One scenario to estimate costs might be \$3,000 per year of community financial aid per year for 1,000 individuals, costing of \$3 million, 250 child care stipends of \$300 per month costing \$900,000 per year, plus another \$100,000 made available in transportation stipends (\$20 per month for 500 students), for a total of \$3.9 million per year. These figures are offered purely as an example of how the program might be structured. Obviously the size of each type of stipend and the number of awards made are all variables that can be set to match the needs and resources of the community.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

Local stipends to remove barriers related to transportation, child care and cost of tuition and fees would not qualify for state matching funds for post-secondary education.

4.6. Help Mercyhurst NE Fulfill the Role of a Community College.

One option that has been discussed in previous years and mentioned in local interviews is to convert Mercyhurst NE to a public community college. This would require agreement by Mercyhurst College to divest Mercyhurst NE as well as agreement by the state to accept the conversion. It is important to note that no support for this option has been expressed by the current administrators of Mercyhurst College.

Mercyhurst NE offers 17 associate degree programs and 7 certificate programs, with an enrollment of 900 students at the campus in North East, PA, about 20 miles northeast of downtown Erie.

A. Brain Gain

Mercyhurst College's enrollment is about 25 percent local residents and 75 percent non-residents from across the state as well as from outside Pennsylvania. Because of its non-resident draw, it may contribute to the brain gain of the region in as much as the non-resident students stay in the region. A study by Penn State Behrend, however, indicates that the four-year colleges in the region ultimately export more graduates than they retain.

In the case of Mercyhurst NE and West, however, the student profile is different. About 70 to 80 percent of the students attending the programs at NE and West are from Erie County and are more place bound due to jobs and families and non-traditional because they are older. In essence, they are more like community college students. Because more of the students are residents who most likely stay in the region upon graduation, converting Mercyhurst NE and West to a public community college has the potential to improve the educational attainment in the region at least as much as it is doing now. If the programs become more affordable, the impact on local educational attainment could potentially be even greater.

B. Flexible

The menu of program offerings at a Mercyhurst public community college would be at least as adaptable as they are now as part of Mercyhurst College. In fact, a Mercyhurst community college might be more flexible because it would have its own governing board rather than operating as a branch campus reporting to a main campus governing board.

C. Low-cost

If Mercyhurst converts from being a private college to a public community college, it would receive local and state funding and should be in a position to substantially lower its tuition and fees to the standard community college rate.

D. Portable

A Mercyhurst community college might choose to seek both ACCSCT and Middle States accreditation to assure maximum transferability of its courses across training and education providers in the region and beyond. Because it would have a different

governance structure than it does now, the accreditation Mercyhurst NE and West currently operate under does not automatically transfer to a Mercyhurst Community College.

E. Geography

While the Mercyhurst NE campus is convenient to some, it is not as centrally located as other options because of its location northeast of downtown Erie.

F. Quality

The current quality of programs at Mercyhurst NE should not be diminished by the conversion to public community college status since it is anticipated that the faculty or curriculum would not change significantly.

G. Permanency

The Mercyhurst NE campus has been part of Mercyhurst since 1991. As is the case for all community colleges across the state, the ongoing viability of Mercyhurst NE as a community college will depend on the level of commitment from state and local policymakers. Mercyhurst NE has established outreach programs to increase enrollment and “wraparound” student services to enhance retention, both of which should contribute to the long-term viability of the school if continued after the conversion.

H. Branded Product

Mercyhurst College is an established brand locally and regionally, and to some extent nationally. The challenge with the current brand is that it is as a private Catholic college with tuition and fees nearly seven times the cost of a public community college. The leaders of a converted Mercyhurst will need to determine the best means to leverage the existing brand perception while marketing to a non-traditional, non-denominational student body.

I. Economic Development Tool

If Mercyhurst NE were to convert to a traditional public community college, it could serve as effective an economic development tool as any stand-alone, bricks-and-mortar public community college in any community. (See previous discussion in Section on “A new, free-standing community college.”)

J. Cost to the Community

The community would need to provide the required local share (see Cost to the Community estimate under option 4.4) as well as find the resources to purchase Mercyhurst NE from Mercyhurst College. The cost of doing so cannot be estimated at this time.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

If Mercyhurst NE were to convert to a public community college, it would need to fully separate from Mercyhurst in terms of governance and assets, and be accredited in its



own right and approved by the Governor, State Board of Education, and meet the requirements set out by the Department of Education.

4.7. Invite Existing Community College to Create Presence in the Region

Butler Community College, at one time, taught courses in Erie County at McDowell High School. Harrisburg Community College is present in multiple counties. While there have been previous discussions around Jamestown Community College (NY) expanding into the area, funding issues become very complicated when a state-funded institution crosses state lines. Each of these options, however, carries the common theme of inviting an existing public community college to expand into the region rather than create a new community college. The expansion would be a branch campus under the governance of the main campus, would probably charge the same tuition and fees, fall under the main campus' accreditation, and share funding with the main campus while being subject to the budget and program decisions of the main campus.

A. Brain Gain

As discussed in earlier community college options, community colleges by their mission target the local and regional population. The goal is to enhance educational attainment through open access to post-secondary education and training.

Typically, community colleges (and especially branch campuses) do not attract a significant proportion of out-of-district students. Also, community colleges are typically commuter campuses without residential facilities, thus removing at least one incentive for students to relocate to the area and to remain after graduation.

B. Flexible

The governance of a branch campus would be centered at the main campus in another county, which means that the branch campus would have to receive main campus approval for any changes in program offerings.

On the other hand, with the additional resources of a main campus, a branch campus potentially will have additional capacity (faculty, curriculum, equipment, expertise) to effectively respond to quick-turnaround employer requests for customized training.

C. Low-cost

As a public community college branch campus, the cost of tuition and fees would be set at or near \$5,700 if there is no local sponsorship (i.e., local share funding) of the branch. In such cases, tuition is set at two-thirds the cost, with the state paying the other third.

D. Portable

At a minimum, courses taken at the branch campus would be transferable to courses of study at the main campus as well as to other colleges who currently have articulation agreements with the main campus. Since community colleges in Pennsylvania are Middle State Commission on Higher Education accredited, it increases the opportunities for transferability of credits to other colleges in the state and elsewhere.

E. Geography

Geographic access depends entirely on where the branch campus will be located.

F. Quality

The quality of the branch campus offerings should be at least as high as those of the main campus. Hopefully, there will be opportunity to share curriculum, faculty and equipment. In addition, the branch campus should fall under the same accreditation as the main campus.

G. Permanency

It is difficult to predict how permanent a branch campus might be. A branch campus' permanence would depend on local community investment and commitment. Having its own facility would add to the permanency.

H. Branded Product

Branding a branch campus would pose a challenge. The main brand would be associated with a different region/county – Butler Community College at Erie, for example. This dilutes the association of the branded product with the region. On the other hand, the sponsoring institution has already invested in branding and marketing their product; high school counselors and employers will be familiar with.

I. Economic Development Tool

As mentioned earlier in this analysis, economic development magazines, such as *Site Selection* and *Expansion Management*, not only discuss the presence of community colleges in prospective locations as an asset, they track legislation affecting the ability of community colleges to offer training and education to local and prospective employers. It stands to reason, therefore, that a community college branch campus could serve as a tool for the economic development of the region.

J. Cost to the Community

The community will probably need to provide the sponsoring community college with incentives to create a branch in the region in order for such an expansion to make business sense for the sponsoring college. Incentives could include facilities, equipment and scholarships; the cost of the incentives cannot be estimated at this time.

K. Alignment with State Requirements to Qualify for State Post-secondary Matching Funds

A branch campus must still be approved by the Governor and the State Board of Education and the application must be reviewed and validated by the Department of Education. Typically, branches are located within about 60 miles of the main campus. An approved branch campus is eligible for state matching funds.

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1. Process for Reaching Recommendations

The Committee met on September 28, 2007 to review the various options presented in the initial draft report outline and to decide on recommendations to move forward. First, the Committee reviewed the list of seven options and identified if there was clear consensus for removing any options. In fact, the first round of discussions resulted in four of the options being removed from the list. The following summarizes the reasons four of the options were removed.

A. Challenge local colleges and universities to better serve the region

- The existing colleges have had many years to consider ways in which to better serve the region's education and training needs, but they have not embraced that as an integral part of their missions. It is the Committee's conclusion therefore, that this option is not feasible. (Note the letter from the President of Mercyhurst College to The Erie Community Foundation in the appendices and an important indicator of a shift in awareness by at least one local college.)
- This option does not allow the region to draw down matching funds.
- The focus of this option is academic based not skill based.
- This option fails to address the cost issue.

B. Help PMI move north.

- PMI's training is too focused on certain types of training and industry; it does not address the breadth of regional training needs.
- This option fails to meet the affordability criteria for students.
- No matching funds can be obtained for this option.
- This option fails to meet the test of portability.

C. Enhance Supportive Services (Child Care/Transportation) and Financial Aid (Vouchers) for Students to Attend Existing Providers

- This option has high cost to the community for too little results.
- The region already has a strong social service system, but it's not fully utilized.
- Schools are very successful in putting together financial aid packages and this option does not appear to add much value.
- Decentralized systems of financial aid and support services fail to solve the problem of creating a centralized solution.

- This solution fails to provide flexible post-secondary education and training offerings
- Enhanced support services fail to address the gaps in existing curriculum.
- State funding cannot be leveraged through this option.
- Financial aid would be more expensive and serve fewer people than investing in a community college. Expanding support services does not address the needs of the region, however, it is not a stand-alone option and could be added to the recommended option.

D. Help Mercyhurst NE Fulfill the Role of a Community College

- The cost of compensating Mercyhurst for the loss of their assets is a significant concern.
- This is not perceived as a solution in and of itself.
- There is significant reluctance to interfere with the success of Mercyhurst NE.

5.2. Top Three Options

The Committee proceeded to debate the merits of the remaining three options – A Regional (Multi-County) Branch Campus Model, Invite Existing Community College to Create Presence in the Region, or A New, Free-standing Community College. The Committee came to a nearly unanimous consensus that, with some caveats, a new, free-standing regional community college was the best option for the region and the one recommended.

The Committee's discussion of each option is summarized below.

A. Adopt a Regional (Multi-County) Branch Campus Model

The Committee recognized that the Multi-County Branch Campus Model (using existing Career Technical Centers as a base) had major strengths, namely, existing facilities, a close connection between secondary and post-secondary education (capturing high school students into a continuing program), and geographic span of service.

The concerns that were raised as this option was discussed include:

- Mixing adult students with high school students. One member noted that security issues may not be relevant since schools already have dual enrollment at colleges – those students are “mixing” with adults. The issue raised, however, was that of the community perception of issues of bringing adults into a high school setting and could such a program overcome recently graduated high school students' reluctance to return to their high school venue as a means for continuing their education?
- Lack of Middle States accreditation. The programs would need to obtain this accreditation to be transferrable to other colleges and to be eligible for state funding.

- Ultimately, this model was trying to keep costs down because of existing facilities, however, facility costs are not the largest cost component; 75 percent of costs will be personnel costs.
- There was a strong concern among members that the school districts could not or would not sponsor this model (i.e. pay for it), especially since it would probably require a separate tax levy. It was pointed out that the Erie School District was unable to win the levy they needed to handle \$150 million in building needs.
- The school district sponsorship model complicates the governance structure. Multiple school district involvement precludes flexibility – if the college has to respond quickly to programming changes, it would require considerable time to go to several different school districts for approval.
- Such a model is too technical and does not offer any academic programming.
- Capacity could be an issue if there needs to be room for at least 500 new enrollees. The smallest community college operating in the state has at least 1,000 enrollees.
- This option did not address the need for easy access to a centralized system, since there was no “home” campus or site; all the campuses would be branch campuses.

B. Invite Existing Community College to Create Presence in the Region

One of the most appealing aspects of having a host community college create a full branch campus in the region is that the state picks up one-third of cost; students pick up two-thirds of the costs. This establishes no obligation on the part of the community to make a financial contribution to the branch campus. The other appealing aspect of this option was that by creating a branch campus, the community would not have to start from scratch to create the necessary programs and administrative structure and obtain the accreditation required for state funding. Also, it would be a reasonable way to test the level of demand for community college programs in the region without having to make a full-scale commitment to a stand-alone college.

The concern raised by several members, and which clearly resonated across the Committee’s membership, was the issue of governance, mission and accountability of a branch campus. Members speculated that the programming might not be focused on and responsive to the needs of this region. Instead, budgetary considerations of the host community college would outweigh local community concerns.

Ultimately, the Committee decided that accountability to a different region of the state was too much of a weakness for the branch campus concept to overcome in spite of the fact that it would cost less to the community. The Committee discussed the option of requesting seats on the home college’s governing board, however, in the end the Committee thought that the governance of an operation so important to NW PA should not be outsourced.

C. Create a New, Free-standing Community College

“We’re the fourth largest community in the state and we don’t have a community college. We need one.” This was one of the emphatic statements from the Steering Committee in the course of discussions of which option to recommend.

It was agreed that Erie County should be the lead county; however, the Committee made it very clear that the new community college had to be regional in scope and that other counties in the region needed to be invited to participate in the planning, creation, and sponsorship of a new community college, even if it was centered in Erie County. In fact, calling it Northwest PA Community College encapsulated the vision the Committee endorsed. The Committee also was very supportive of creating branch campuses or sites across the region if warranted.

Erie County Executive Mark DiVecchio laid out the highpoints of a draft business plan for his vision of the Northwest PA Community College. In his plan, Erie County would provide a loan for \$500,000 for start up funding to sustain administrative costs for first two years. That loan would be paid back to the County beginning in 2011. The plan contains mainly a list of academic programs, with all other programs (mainly technical) to be provided by other training providers.

The Committee began discussing the details of the draft business plan, however it was decided that debating that level of detail was not the role of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee; the Committee was not going to design a business plan nor was it going to draft the application for a community college. The Committee did recognize that, clearly, there are a lot of details to work out once the final report is released in October.

5.3. Final Decision

A. Recommendation

The final recommendation of the Committee is to create a Northwest PA community college as a free standing community college with the invitation to other counties in the region to co-sponsor with Erie to have branch campuses. Outlying counties do not have to participate; and if so, the tuition rates for their residents would be different – two-thirds the cost instead of one-third the cost for sponsoring counties.

B. Driving Arguments

As the Committee debated the strengths and weaknesses of the top three options, three basic concerns rose to the surface and became the driving arguments in favor of a stand-alone regional community college: 1) affordability to the student, 2) creating a centralized education and training system, and 3) having a governance structure in place that was first and foremost concerned with meeting the community’s changing needs with regards to post-secondary training and education. As one member emphasized, when the virtues for comparing the options was described, “mission” or alignment with the communities’ priorities should be key – “Is it the mission of this entity to serve this region and to do the things we want to do here?”

C. Steering Committee's Concerns and Caveats

In addition to the final recommendation to create a new, free-standing community college, the Committee includes the following recommendations and caveats to guide the region's work moving forward:

- This new school must remain flexible, even to the point that it may need to respond to the needs of each county or a specific community.
- The invitation must be extended to the other counties, i.e. "We're on the ground floor and we would like to invite you to participate."
- At the end of the process, even if none of the other counties participate, Erie County should move forward.
- Industry advisory groups must be developed to keep current on the needs of businesses and the communities and to continually inform the community college.
- Diversity of programming is important. There needs to be academic and technical programs.
- The broken data collection system must be fixed so that the community college can address local needs. There are data collection methods in place – BREP, WIB, Industry Partnerships – that could be more relevant with some refinement.

5.4. Next Steps

The formal process required by the state to create a new community college includes receiving written approval by the Governor of Pennsylvania and assurance that the funding will be available, clearance of the application by the Pennsylvania Department of Education, and approval by the State Board of Education. The approval and start up process takes approximately two years; the last time a new community college was created in the state was in 1991.

The application is a complex and detailed document requiring not only careful planning, but also detailed projections of demand and enrollment over several years. Start-up funding will be required not only for preparation of the application, but also for preliminary faculty and administrator contracts to prepare the college to open its doors.

The current Erie County Executive has pledged funding for start up, has developed a detailed business plan, and has approached the Steering Committee to help move the process forward. It is hoped that the business community, through the Growth Partnership division of the Erie Regional Chamber & Growth Partnership will also play an important leadership role in moving this issue from discussion to reality.

6. APPENDICES

6.1. Excerpt from June 2007 Progress Report

Purpose of Steering Committee

In the course of a community meeting to discuss the region's quest to create a community college, the Deputy Secretary of Labor and Industry (DLI) for the Commonwealth, charged the community with addressing the right problem with the right solution. The community was challenged to conduct a gap analysis to identify the need that a community college would fill and DLI offered to help however possible.⁴² The Erie Community Foundation (ECF) agreed to serve as convener of the Gaps Analysis Steering Committee – a group of individuals in leadership positions representing several different counties, government, education, economic development, workforce and the non-profit/community development sectors (see list of members in Appendix). The Department of Labor and Industry agreed to fund a consultant (**Public Works**) to facilitate the process, assist with the research, and write the Committee's report.

Strategy/Work Plan

In order to reach a common base of understanding and agreement to define the problem that a community college is supposed to solve, the consultant designed a list of four hierarchical questions for the Committee to address:

1. What is the demand for skills in the region – current and future -- requiring some post-secondary education of two years or less?
2. What is the supply of skilled workers to meet the demand for these occupations?
3. Is the skill supply adequate to meet demand now and in the future? i.e., what is the gap?
4. What are the causes of the gap between supply and demand?

To avoid duplicating previous efforts, the initial strategy was to review all existing reports on the issue and identify where additional research was needed to answer the four critical questions. The consultant reviewed seventeen different documents produced on the topic: nine reports containing some level of data, six proposal/applications and two memos or letters. The data analyzed from the existing reports included demographics, economics, income, labor force, and education. Research methodologies ranged from surveys and interviews, to macro-analyses of industries and micro-analyses of sector workforce. In most cases, the data was dated from 2000 or earlier.

Along with ECF serving as conveners of the Steering Committee, the Foundation helped to coalesce a group of individuals to carry out the work needed to support the Committee's efforts. The staff work group included Robert Heibel, Director of the

Research/Intelligence Analyst Program at Mercyhurst College, Bill Welch, faculty member in the Research/Intelligence Analysts Program at Mercyhurst College, Andreea Neagu and Andrey Allakhverdov, both undergraduate students in the Research/Intelligence Analyst Program at Mercyhurst College, Mary Bula, Executive Director of the Erie Regional Chamber and Growth Partnership, Amy Cuzzola-Kern, Vice President of Programs, ECF, and Sidney Hacker, Senior Policy Analyst, Public Works LLC. The analysis of existing reports helped to focus the work of the project staff. A detailed set of assignments was written up and presented to the group, including deliverables, deadlines, data and information gaps to be addressed, and purpose of the information. Much of the purpose of the information was derived from the need to define the problem (through the four basic questions). However, the four questions were also closely tied to the information that would be required for any community college application submitted to the Pennsylvania Department of Education and the forthcoming Technology Program Grant application.

Meetings to Date

The members of the Steering Committee, over the course of four meetings (three Steering Committee and one Research Work Group), covered several critical issues. In addition to receiving reports on the skills, demand and education requirements research, the supply of skilled and educated workers, and the gap between the two, the Committee also discussed their overall goals and the definition of “region.”

The first meeting (February 23, 2007) served as an introduction to the project and the strategy for fulfilling the Committee’s purpose. The consultant reviewed the status of research as provided by existing reports and the need for additional research. The consultant also presented a strategy for defining the problem the Steering Committee was convened to address. This serves as a critical step in the work of the Steering Committee, because without common agreement as to what the problem is, agreement as to what the solutions need to be – in detail – will be impossible to develop.

The second meeting was used to identify, through a nominal group technique, the Committee’s goals. The following multi-part question was posed to the members:

What, in your mind, would be the ideal impact on this region of the efforts of this committee both in the short term (5 years) and the long term (20 years)? What result would you consider to be indicators of success?

After receiving responses from all the Committee members present, and then identifying the top five themes through each Committee members’ priority ranking, the following emerged:

<u>TOP FIVE SHORT TERM THEMES</u>	<u>TOP FIVE LONG TERM THEMES</u>
1. Increased access to education	1. Agility
2. Regional scope and buy-in	2. Brain gain
3. Affordability (tied for 3 rd)	3. Improve global competitiveness of

	businesses
4. Community buy-in (tied for 3 rd)	4. Economic/income/skills/population growth
5. Identify technical and vocational needs/gaps and establish framework for addressing	5. Visionary/futuristic look to train for the future; coordinate with economic development/business attraction efforts

The Committee members' list of indicators of success included the following:

<u>Indicators of Success</u>
Community college linked to workforce training
Increased household income in the region to level of 10% above national average
Lower unemployment
Less people using TANF/welfare/PA
Population Growth
Brain gain
Increased business attraction
Increased satisfaction among business owners/employers
Affordable education for low-income students; those without resources
Location survey results
Economic growth, retention students, #new professionals, families
Increase in associate degrees
New technological jobs
Business retention/expansion
Positive community buy-in
Widely respected CC offering good programs will exist
Employment opportunities available here
Higher percent of population under 35
Number of single mothers obtaining degrees
Avoid giant bricks and mortar project
Plan endorsed by government and economic development leaders
Higher number of people with bachelor and master's degrees
No unfilled jobs

In addition to the discussion of impact and indicators of success, the Committee discussed the definition of "region." For research purposes, the consultant had identified a seven-county region bounded by the Northwest Pennsylvania WIB and two other Counties. The seven counties are Erie, Crawford, Warren, Forest, Venango, Clarion and Mercer. The Committee did not reach a conclusive definition of "region," noting that the gap analysis research examining regional supply and demand is of ultimate importance in making that determination. However, the Committee did agree that:

- Research is being done on a seven county area.
- This is a multi-county initiative even though the exact counties are not yet identified.
- The point when this decision must be made will be part of the continued work.

The third meeting on May 4, 2007, was limited to the Research Work Group. The Work Group included five volunteers from the full Committee. John Elliot, Ron Wilga, Sandra Myers, Dave Bauer and Steve Bishop agreed to meet on behalf of the full committee to closely review the detailed research work of the Mercyhurst College Interns, and to determine whether or not the research met an 80 percent confidence standard needed to provide the necessary foundation for future Committee discussions. The research presented addressed the questions of demand and supply, and preliminary information regarding the gap between the two. The Work Group members asked several questions which led to additional research assignments for the project staff. Some questions were generated by the tension created between what the data revealed and what the experience or anecdotal information was of the Research Work Group members. However, many of the questions revolved around the issue of causes of the gap more than the data defining the demand and supply. For example:

- What percent of enrollment in local institutions is made up of local residents?
- What is the cost to students of existing education and training providers?
- What are the offerings and what is their capacity and quality?
- What are the educational aspirations of local high school graduates and how do their aspirations compare to residents of counties with community colleges?

Individual Work Group members also provided some formal written feedback.

On May 18, 2007, at the fourth meeting, the Interns presented research on the demand, supply and gap between the two to the full Committee. In addition, the consultant provided some preliminary research findings regarding potential causes of the gap between supply and demand. Two Committee members also reported on their experience at the Pennsylvania House Education hearing on the proposed technical program grants. The point was made that the technical program grants are not seen by the Pennsylvania Department of Education as a substitute for a community college, but instead as a potential stepping stone to one.

6.2. List of Regional Programs

Program	Awards / Degrees	No. of Programs in Region
Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training	Certificates	4
Cosmetology/Cosmetologist, General	Certificates	3
Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Certificates	3
Medical/Clinical Assistant	Certificates	3
Computer and Information Sciences, General	Certificates	2
Data Entry/Microcomputer Applications, General	Certificates	2
General Office Occupations and Clerical Services	Certificates	2
Accounting and Computer Science	Certificates	1
Accounting and Related Services, Other	Certificates	1
Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General	Certificates	1
Business, Management, Marketing & Related Support Services, Other	Certificates	1
Business/Office Automation/Technology/Data Entry	Certificates	1
Computer Programming/Programmer, General	Certificates	1
Computer Science	Certificates	1
Criminal Justice/Safety Studies	Certificates	1
Dental Assisting/Assistant	Certificates	1
Diagnostic Medical Sonography/Sonographer & Ultrasound Technician	Certificates	1
Executive Assistant/Executive Secretary	Certificates	1
Gerontology	Certificates	1
Health Information/Medical Records Technology/Technician	Certificates	1

Program	Awards / Degrees	No. of Programs in Region
Hotel/Motel Administration/Management	Certificates	1
Legal Assistant/Paralegal	Certificates	1
Massage Therapy/Therapeutic Massage	Certificates	1
Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary	Certificates	1
Medical Insurance Coding Specialist/Coder	Certificates	1
Medical Office Management/Administration	Certificates	1
Nail Technician/Specialist and Manicurist	Certificates	1
Nurse/Nursing Assistant/Aide and Patient Care Assistant	Certificates	1
Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN)	Certificates	1
Pharmacy Technician/Assistant	Certificates	1
Physical Therapist Assistant	Certificates	1
Plastics Engineering Technology/Technician	Certificates	1
Precision Production, Other	Certificates	1
Quality Control Technology/Technician	Certificates	1
Retailing and Retail Operations	Certificates	1
Surgical Technology/Technologist	Certificates	1
Tool and Die Technology/Technician	Certificates	1
Tourism and Travel Services Management	Certificates	1
Trade and Industrial Teacher Education	Certificates	1
Veterinary/Animal Health Technology/Technician/Veterinary Assistant	Certificates	1
Web/Multimedia Management and Webmaster	Certificates	1
Welding Technology/Welder	Certificates	1
Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's	7
Business Administration and Management, General	Associate's	5

Program	Awards / Degrees	No. of Programs in Region
Computer and Information Sciences and Support Services, Other	Associate's	5
Business/Commerce, General	Associate's	4
Criminal Justice/Law Enforcement Administration/Police Science/Safety Studies	Associate's	4
Legal Administrative Assistant/Secretary	Associate's	4
Accounting	Associate's	3
Early Childhood Education and Teaching	Associate's	3
Legal Assistant/Paralegal	Associate's	3
Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN)	Associate's	3
Physical Therapist Assistant	Associate's	3
Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General	Associate's	2
Computer Programming/Programmer, General	Associate's	2
Electrical/Electronic/Communication Engineer Technology/Technician	Associate's	2
Executive Assistant/Executive Secretary	Associate's	2
Information Science/Studies	Associate's	2
Marketing/Marketing Management, General	Associate's	2
Mechanical Engineering/Mechanical Technology/Technician	Associate's	2
Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary	Associate's	2
Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Associate's	2
Accounting and Business/Management	Associate's	1
Accounting Technology/Technician and Bookkeeping	Associate's	1
Allied Health and Medical Assisting Services, Other	Associate's	1
Architectural Drafting and Architectural CAD/CADD	Associate's	1
Biological and Physical Sciences	Associate's	1
Computer Science	Associate's	1

Program	Awards / Degrees	No. of Programs in Region
Data Processing and Data Processing Technology/Technician	Associate's	1
Electrician	Associate's	1
Health Information/Medical Records Technology/Technician	Associate's	1
Hospitality Administration/Management, General	Associate's	1
Human Development and Family Studies, General	Associate's	1
Industrial Production Technologies/Technicians, Other	Associate's	1
Management Information Systems, General	Associate's	1
Manufacturing Technology/Technician	Associate's	1
Mechanical Drafting and Mechanical Drafting CAD/CADD	Associate's	1
Medical Office Assistant/Specialist	Associate's	1
Medical Office Management/Administration	Associate's	1
Medical Radiologic Technology/Science - Radiation Therapist	Associate's	1
Medical/Clinical Assistant	Associate's	1
Mental and Social Health Services and Allied Professions, Other	Associate's	1
Office Management and Supervision	Associate's	1
Plastics Engineering Technology/Technician	Associate's	1
Respiratory Care Therapy/Therapist	Associate's	1
Social Sciences, Other	Associate's	1
Social Work	Associate's	1
Special Education and Teaching, General	Associate's	1
Tourism and Travel Services Management	Associate's	1

6.3. List of Interviewees

The following individuals were gracious to give of their time and insights through a series of individual interviews in July and August 2007:

- Dr. Robert W. Oliver, Assistant Superintendent, Erie City School District
- The Honorable Jane Earll, Pennsylvania State Senator, 49th District
- Dr. Antoine M. Garibaldi, President, Gannon University
- Sandra Myers, Superintendent, Union City Area School District
- Jerry E. Knight, Executive Director, PMI (Precision Manufacturing Institute)
- Dr. William Garvey
- Dr. Jack D. Burke, Chancellor, Penn State Erie, The Behrend College
- Rick Griffith, Owner, Erie Institute of Technology
- Dr. Aldo Jackson, Director, Erie County Career Technical School
- Dr. Gary Brown, Executive Vice President, Mercyhurst NE
- Dr. Jeremy D. Brown, Edinboro University of Pennsylvania
- Ron Wilga
- Janet Anderson, Office of Sen. Jane Earll
- Bob Spaulding, Director of Economic Development, Erie County
- P.C. Hoop Roche, President, Erie Plastics Corporation
- Ralph Pontillo, President, Erie Manufacturers Association
- Jake Rouch, President & CEO, Erie Regional Chamber & Growth Partnership
- Honorable Mark DiVecchio, Erie County Executive

6.4. Inventory of Reports

Inventory of Reports

	Report Title	Date	Author	Client/Audience	Purpose
1	<i>Strategic Economic Development Plan and</i>	1998	Strategy Solutions Inc.	NW PA Regional Planning and Development	Analyze past planning activities and provide a retrospective and some recommendations to
2	<i>Toward an Economic Development Strategy for Erie</i>	2001	FutureWorks Company and Regional Technology Strategies, Inc.	Economic Development Corporation of Erie County	Establish an economic development strategy for the region (i.e., Erie MSA, Erie County)
3	<i>Community Colleges and the Future of Pennsylvania: An Agenda for Public Policy</i>	2001	National Center for Higher Education Management Systems	Pennsylvania Commission for Community Colleges	To what extent are community college services being provided to people in the Commonwealth? Identify barriers to meeting the unmet needs of the state – state and local policy (financing, regulation, and governing structures). Recommend steps that might be taken to remove some of these barriers
4	<i>Proposal for Erie Conference on Community Development</i>	Nov. 10, 2001	Dr. James Jacobs	Erie Conference on Community Development	Outline a proposal for an empirical investigation into the present career and technical education, its outcomes, opportunities for alignment and change, and a plan to achieve these changes, accompanied by concrete suggestions and strategic paths.
5	<i>Erie Conference on Community Development & Erie County School District Regional Task Force on Career & Technical Education: Statement & Recommendation;</i>	N/A	Erie Conference on Community Development & Erie County School District Regional Task Force on Career and Technical Education	N/A	Request that Erie County's four undergraduate colleges and universities, CAM Tech, and the County of Erie financially support a comprehensive assessment of career and technical education continuum in Erie County, including an audit of current programs, practices, facilities, equipment, placement/counseling practices, and faculty, educational attainment/performance among the student population, and local/state/federal financial support. Also, assess the existing manner in which skill sets necessary to meet industry's short- and long-term employment demands are developed and updated.
6	<i>Memo on Revised Erie Approach</i>	Jan. 19, 2002	Dr. James Jacobs	Jake Rouch	Revise prior proposal to meet the following concerns: (1) addition of post-secondary administrators to group; (2) Desire for development of a process for the various administrators to create good working relationships; (3) concern that the original proposal spent too much time and effort in the gathering of empirical information on the needs of the community; (4) greater emphasis placed by the new group in the development of post-secondary institutions.
7	<i>Scanning the Erie Educational Environment: Part IV Post Secondary System (power point)</i>	June 2002	Dr. James Jacobs & Dr. Roberta Teahen	N/A	N/A
8	<i>Workforce Investment Board - Employer Needs Assessment & Gap Analysis Project</i>	2003	Strategy Solutions Inc.	NW WIB	To assist in determining recommendations for how o best address the need for a new community or technical college in the region versus meeting that need by enhancing the

	Report Title	Date	Author	Client/Audience	Purpose
9	<i>Strategy and Action Plan for Economic Development</i>	February 2003	FutureWorks (aka Bosworth Report)	Northwest Pennsylvania Regional Planning and Development commission	Assist the Northwest PA Regional Planning and Development commission and allied organizations in the region in developing the foundation for a Strategy and Action Plan for Economic Development in NW PA.
10	<i>The Western PA Community College Consortium: A Proposal for Delivering Increased Career and Technology Training Services to Northwestern</i>	May 2003	U.S. Representative John E. Peterson	5th Congressional District	Not Explicitly Stated
11	<i>Workforce Leadership Grants FY2003-04 Community College Planning and Service Expansion Grants</i>	2003	PA Dept. of Community and Economic Development, special Assistant to the Secretary on Workforce Development	Local WIB; educational or community-based organization formed to provide educational services, form a community college or expand community college services.	Grants to complete planning and implementation strategies for the establishment of a community college, or for the deliver and/or expansion of community college services within local workforce investment areas of the Commonwealth that are underserved,
12	<i>Mercyhurst's Mandate in Geriatric Nursing Education</i>	2005	Hirtzel Institute on Aging (Dr. Linda Rhodes)	Mercyhurst North East	Better understand the needs and growing demands of geriatric nursing within the region through a market and labor analysis and strategic options study for the geriatric-related educational programs and degrees offered at Mercyhurst North East.
13	<i>Letter from Timothy M. Sennett to Dr. Aldo R. Jackson, Director, Erie County Technical School</i>	Oct. 12, 2005	Timothy Sennett, Of Counsel, Knox, McLaughlin, Gornall & Sennett	Dr. Aldo R. Jackson	Follow-up their discussion at superintendents' meeting of Friday, Oct. 7, 2005 regarding the guidelines and process for establishing a community college.
14	<i>SGA for Community-Based Job Training Grant</i>	2006	Northwest Pennsylvania Technical Education Network	US Department of Labor	Apply for a grant to develop a regional training database, to offset the cost of training and to provide enhanced collaborative service through the branch campus model of the career and technical centers in the region.
15	<i>Grant Application for Nonprofit Capacity Building: Technical Community College Proposal</i>	2006	Regional Center for Workforce Excellence	Erie Community Foundation	Requesting a grant to design and establish a technical community college for NW PA. The grant funds will provide the manpower to compose and submit an institutional-approval application to the PA Dept. of Ed for a technical community college.
16	<i>A proposal to improve the quality of life in Northwest Pennsylvania through technical education and workforce development -- A Technical Community College for Northwest Pennsylvania</i>	July/ August 2006	Erie County Technical School (ects.org)	School Directors of Erie County School Districts	Proposal to use existing Career & Technical Centers as the operational and financial foundation for the proposed Technical community College in Northwest PA's operation.
17	<i>Letter from Joseph N. Hankin to (unknown), dated (unknown), Re: (unknown) (pages 3-6); also missing appendices A-C referenced in letter)</i>	N/A	Joseph N. Hankin, president, Westchester Community College and with Teacher's College, Columbia University	N/A	Unknown; it seems to be a review/ critique of another consultant's report

6.5. Educational Attainment Comparisons

S1501: Educational Attainment
Data Set: 2005 American Community Survey
Survey: 2005 American Community Survey

NOTE. Data are limited to the household population and exclude the population living in institutions, college dormitories, and other group quarters. For information on confidentiality protection, sampling error, non-sampling error, and definitions, see Survey Methodology.

County	Subject	Total	Percent with Associate's or Less but some Higher Ed
Beaver	Population 25 years and over	122,379	27.9%
U.S.	Population 25 years and over	188,950,759	27.50%
Allegheny	Population 25 years and over	838,165	25.7%
Butler	Population 25 years and over	119,662	25.6%
Northampton	Population 25 years and over	190,866	25.5%
Westmoreland	Population 25 years and over	257,831	25.1%
Bucks	Population 25 years and over	419,393	24.6%
Dauphin	Population 25 years and over	169,232	24.6%
Luzerne	Population 25 years and over	214,150	24.4%
Mercer	Population 25 years and over	78,724	23.5%
Berks	Population 25 years and over	256,266	22.6%
Delaware	Population 25 years and over	355,992	22.5%
State of PA	Population 25 years and over	8,180,457	22.30%
Warren*	Population 25 years and over	30,535	22.1%
Erie	Population 25 years and over	175,803	21.9%
Montgomery	Population 25 years and over	517,403	21.3%
Lawrence	Population 25 years and over	62,839	21.2%
Crawford	Population 25 years and over	58,058	19.4%
Cambria	Population 25 years and over	99,653	18.8%
Lancaster	Population 25 years and over	312,839	18.7%
Venango*	Population 25 years and over	39,366	18.50%
Forest*	Population 25 years and over	3,540	17.30%
Clarion*	Population 25 years and over	26,334	16.10%
Lebanon	Population 25 years and over	84,277	15.5%

Shaded counties have a public community college.
*2000 data used; 2005 data not available.

6.6. NPTI Audit Report

Robert G. Casey, Jr., Auditor General, *Summary Report: Northwest Pennsylvania Technical Institute and Wrightco Technologies, Inc.*, October 2003, pp. 2-3.

Northwest Pennsylvania Technical Institute (NPTI)

From 1991 to 2001, NPTI, located in Erie and originally known as the Erie County Technical Institute, operated as a technical institute under the Act. As required by the Act, NPTI was to operate in accordance with a plan approved by the SBE. NPTI's operations were to be administered and supervised by a Board of Trustees. NPTI received operating revenue from the Commonwealth, via PDE, and from Erie, Crawford and Warren Counties, as well as from student tuition. NPTI received approximately \$34.8 million in operating revenue from the Commonwealth through PDE. From the 1994-95 fiscal year through the 2000-2001 fiscal year, NPTI also received approximately \$3.7 million from Erie County.

NPTI was intended to be a two-year multi-purpose, degree-granting technical institute to provide training to rebuild Erie County's labor pool and meet changing skill needs of workers and employers. NPTI was to offer training in a number of settings, "from formal classrooms to the factory floor to the business office environment," and provide, through agreements with providers and technical experts, training that would prepare students for a role in the area's job market, make available programs, apprenticeships, certificates and associate degrees, promote occupational, technical, intellectual and personal development through credit and non-credit courses, and provide instruction in specific skills training and remedial education for adults. NPTI was intended to function as a school "without walls," i.e., without a campus. Classes were to be provided by public, private and non-profit providers with which NPTI had cooperative agreements. Training was to include short-term flexible courses for specific firms or industries and one or two-year credit programs that could lead to diplomas, certificates or degrees. NPTI's geographical area included Erie, Crawford and Warren counties; it subsequently expanded to cover 14 counties in the northwest corner of the Commonwealth....

...As a community college, NPTI was required to maintain financial records in accordance with the Act's requirements. Each year, NPTI received payments from PDE for operational expenses, capital equipment and furnishings based on an annual budget submitted by NPTI. After the close of each fiscal year, NPTI filed a reimbursement claim with PDE and justification for the amount it received from the Commonwealth. Each NPTI claim was audited by the LECS Comptroller's Office. The audits included substantiating the amount of payments of Commonwealth funds to which NPTI was entitled, evaluating NPTI's internal controls, accounting and reporting, and determining whether NPTI operated in accordance with applicable laws, regulations, and PDE directives.

LECS auditors made numerous and repeated findings of major weaknesses and questionable practices concerning the financial management of NPTI. Based on the continuing deficiencies disclosed in the audits, PDE and the LECS Comptroller's Office



concluded that NPTI was required to repay to the Commonwealth a substantial portion of the Commonwealth funds it had received. As a result of the audits for the 1991-92 through 1996-97 fiscal years, auditors concluded that NPTI had received over \$3.3 million in “overpayments,” i.e., funds that NPTI was not entitled to and which should be repaid to the Commonwealth. By December 2002, after audits for later years were completed, the total that NPTI owed to the Commonwealth had grown to approximately \$16 million.

6.7. Letter from Mercyhurst College



Mercyhurst
COLLEGE

OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT

September 19, 2007

Mike Batchelor
Erie Community Foundation
127 W. 6th Street
Erie, PA 16501

Dear Mike, *Mike*

As you know Mercyhurst College has long recognized the need for higher education affordability and access, especially for the poor. Many of us at Mercyhurst College have been following and participating in the recent discussions of the need for improved higher education access and affordability and the role of a community college in meeting that need. While the early discussions were primarily focused on meeting the needs of employers and led to some disagreement about the nature and magnitude of the need, more recent discussions have focused on local poverty rates and the need to increase access to affordable higher education especially for students from lower-income families in the region.

In our opinion there should be little controversy about the need for affordable higher education, particularly in the Erie region. Several years ago now the Mercyhurst Civic Institute in cooperation with public and private partners including Erie County and the Erie Community Foundation published *Directions: Understanding the Well-Being of Erie County Children*, a document which described in great detail the plight of poor children and youth in Erie County. More recently the Civic Institute worked with the Community Foundation on the publication of the Foundation's important work on poverty in the region (*The High Cost of Poverty: It Affects Us All*).

In keeping with the original vision of the Sisters of Mercy, in 1991, Mercyhurst made a substantial commitment in creating Mercyhurst North East which was founded to increase access to higher education for young people who faced challenges getting into or paying for higher education. To help achieve that purpose the tuition and fees at Mercyhurst North East have been held to about ½ those at the Erie campus and admission criteria have been eased significantly. Over the years we have learned that successfully serving this population requires a real commitment and a substantial investment in student and academic support services. As a result approximately 2500 students, primarily from the Erie region have received associate degrees or advanced certificates from Mercyhurst North East and many of those students have gone on to receive bachelor degrees and beyond at Mercyhurst College and other institutions. A year ago Mercyhurst opened a branch in Girard. Like our center in Corry, tuition is set at the same level as Mercyhurst North East.

Under current guidelines for the federal Pell grant program and the PHEAA grant program in Pennsylvania the neediest students enrolled at Mercyhurst North East are eligible for grants (exclusive of loans) totaling upward of \$8,500. In addition students are eligible for institutional grants funded by Mercyhurst which average approximately \$2,000 per student. In combination,

501 East 38th Street • Erie, Pennsylvania 16546 • Ph: 814.824.2311 • Fx: 814.824.3333



Mercyhurst
COLLEGE

OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT

these funds go a long way toward meeting the \$12,500 average first year cost of most of our programs. Mercyhurst has also made a commitment that any student who successfully completes an associate degree program at MNE can attend Mercyhurst Erie for about the same cost of tuition they were paying at Mercyhurst North East. It is also instructive to note that just recently Congress has passed an increase in the level of Pell grants, which, if signed by the President will also help with affordability. Admittedly there are costs of college attendance that go beyond tuition and fees, but it is important that everyone realize that an important part of the issue has to do with education about college search, college accessibility and financial aide options.

For all the good that has been done at Mercyhurst North East, the Adult College, Corry and now at Mercyhurst West, we are acutely aware that even at ½ the tuition of our Erie campus affordability and access remain serious obstacles for many area students. We agree with you that there is a need for a community-wide effort to break down the barriers to higher education. Mercyhurst as an institution of higher education, and as heir to the mission of the Sisters of Mercy, fully appreciates and acknowledges that there is an unmet need in the community and stands ready to help in any way and to work with our community partners so that this remaining need can finally be addressed.

If you are interested in discussing more specific ways that we can work together to meet the need please contact me.

Sincerely,

Thomas J. Gamble
President
Mercyhurst College

cc Mark DiVecchio



6.8. Inventory of Post-secondary Training and Education Capacity in the Region

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/ Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Accounting	Associate's		1	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Accounting	Associate's		20	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Accounting	Associate's	1	12	\$11,000	3.86	\$12 - \$14 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Accounting and Business/ Management	Associate's	1	0	\$15,000	5.26		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		85%
Erie	Northwest Regional Technology Institute	Private for-profit, less-than 2-year	Accounting and Computer Science	Certificates	0	59	\$9,400	3.30	\$11-\$13 per hour	(Full)	Yes	Yes	N/A	85%
Erie	GECAC Training Institute	Private not for-profit, less-than 2-year	Accounting and Related Services, Other	Certificates		6	\$4,550	1.60	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Accounting Technician and Bookkeeping	Associate's		0	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General	Associate's	1	2	\$18,000	6.32	\$10 per hour	Yes		No		
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General	Certificates Associate's	3	1	\$15,000	5.26		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		88%
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Allied Health and Medical Assisting Services, Other	Associate's	7	22	\$6,616	2.32	Resp 32k, Rad 25k, RN 30k-45K	Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Triangle Tech Inc-Erie	Private for profit, 2-year	Architectural Drafting and Architectural CAD/CADD	Associate's		12	\$12,263	4.30		Yes		No	97%	
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Biological and Physical Sciences	Associate's		2	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Business Administration and Management, General	Associate's	1	9	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Business Administration and Management, General	BS & Associate's	2,1	6	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes		69%

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Business Administration and Management, General	Associate's	4	23	\$20,364	7.15	n/a	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Business Administration and Management, General	Associate's	1	16	\$18,000	6.32	\$10 per hour	Yes		No		
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Business Administration and Management, General	Associate's	1	21	\$15,000	5.26		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		85%
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Business, Management, Marketing & Related Support Services, Other	Associate's		1	\$15,000	5.26		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Business/Commerce, General	Associate's		10	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Business/Commerce, General	Associate's		2	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	*PA State University-Penn State Erie-Behrend College	Public, 4-year or above	Business/Commerce, General	Associate's			\$10,958	3.84		Yes		No	72.50%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College \$2,850	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Mercer	Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Business/Commerce, General	4 Year Also Associate's		10	\$9,624	3.38	N/A	Yes	Yes	No	93%	N/A
Erie	Triangle Tech Inc-Erie	Private for profit, 2-year	Carpentry/Carpenter	Associate's		10	\$12,263	4.30		Yes		No	97%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences and Support Services, Other	Associate's	7	27	\$13,970	4.90		Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences and Support Services, Other	None		1	\$13,970	4.90		Yes		Yes		
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences, General	BS & Associate's	1, 1	2	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Computer and Information Sciences, General	Associate's		9	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences, General	Associate's	1	3	\$20,364	\$2,850 7.15	n/a	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences, General	Associate's		9	\$13,970	4.90		Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer and Information Sciences, General	None		15	\$13,970	4.90		Yes		Yes		
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Computer Programming /Programmer, General	Associate's		6	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer Programming /Programmer, General	Associate's		5	\$13,970	4.90		Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Computer Programming /Programmer, General	None		8	\$13,970	4.90		Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Mercer	PSC Academy Inc	Private for-profit, less-than-2-year	Cosmetology, Barber/Styling, and Nail Instructor	Certificates		1	\$8,950	3.14	\$55,000	Yes	Yes-clock hours (not credits)	Yes	N/A	N/A
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Cosmetology/ Cosmetologist, General	(Diploma) Certificates	1	86	\$9,500	3.33	\$10 - \$12 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Mercer	PSC Academy Inc	Private for-profit, less-than-2-year	Cosmetology/ Cosmetologist, General	Certificates	4	22	\$8,950	3.14	\$55,000	Yes	Yes-clock hours (not credits)	Yes	N/A	N/A
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Criminal Justice/Law Enforcement Administration	Associate's	1	7	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (No)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Criminal Justice/Police Science	BA & Associate's	1, 1	8	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Criminal Justice/Safety Studies	Associate's		5	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Criminal Justice/Safety Studies	Associate's	2	38	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Criminal Justice/Safety Studies	Certificates	1	30	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Data Entry/Microcomputer Applications, General	Certificates		2	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	Northwest Regional Technology Institute	Private for-profit, less than 2-year	Data Entry/Microcomputer Applications, General	Certificates	0	5	\$9,400	3.30	\$10-\$12 per hour	(Full)	Yes	Yes	N/A	82%
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Dental Assisting/Assistant	(Diploma) Certificates	1	37	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$12 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Diagnostic Medical Sonography/Sonographer & Ultrasound Technician	(Diploma) Certificates	1	23	\$9,500	3.33	\$14 -\$22 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Early Childhood Education and Teaching	Associate's	1	6	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Early Childhood Education and Teaching	Associate's	1	8	\$20,364	\$2,850 7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Erie Institute of Technology Inc.	Private, for-profit, 2-year	Electrical/Electronic/Communication Engr Technology/Technician	Associate's		8	\$11,380	3.99		Yes		Yes		
Erie	PA State University-Penn State Erie-Behrend College	Public, 4-year or above	Electrical/Electronic/Communications Engr Technology/Technician	No Associate's	0	6	\$10,446	3.67		Yes (Full)	Yes	No	72.50%	
Erie	Triangle Tech Inc-Erie	Private for profit, 2-year	Electrician	Associate's		34	\$12,263	4.30		Yes		No	97%	
Erie	Triangle Tech Inc-Erie	Private for profit, 2-year	Electrician	Certificates		2	\$12,263	4.30		Yes		No	97%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Executive Assistant/Executive Secretary	Associate's		5	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Executive Assistant/Executive Secretary	Certificates		2	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Executive Assistant/Executive Secretary (Combined with Adm Asst & Sec Science)	Associate's		6	\$7,200	2.53		Yes (Full)	Yes	Yes		

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Crawford	Precision Manufacturing Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Certificates			6	\$5,725 to \$19,875	2.01 to 6.97		N/A		N/A		
Erie	GECAC Training Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	General Office Occupations and Clerical Services	Certificates		5	\$4,550	1.60	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A
Erie	Gannon University	Private not-for-profit, 4-year or above	Gerontology	Certificates		2	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Health Information/Medical Records Technology/Technician	Certificates		11	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Health Information/Medical Records Technology/Technician	Associate's	1	24	\$18,000	6.32	\$11 per hour	Yes		No		
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not-for-profit, 4-year or above	Hospitality Administration/Management, General	Associate's	3	19	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Hotel/Motel Administration/Management	Certificates		1	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Mercer	Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Human Development and Family Studies, General	Bachelors' Associate's	1	17	\$9,624	3.38		Yes	Yes	No	N/A	N/A
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Industrial Production Technologies/ Technicians, Other	Associate's	20	7	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Information Science/Studies	Associate's		5	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Mercer	Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Information Science/Studies	Piloting a 4-year Associate's	1	6	\$9,624	3.38	High \$20's/ Low \$30's	Yes	Yes	No	N/A	---
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Kindergarten/Preschool Education and Teaching	BS & Associate's	1,	14	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Legal Administrative Assistant/Secretary	Associate's	1	6	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Legal Administrative Assistant/Secretary	Associate's		2	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Legal Administrative Assistant/Secretary	Associate's	1	4	\$18,000	6.32	\$9 per hour	Yes		No		
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Legal Administrative Assistant/Secretary (Combined with Adm Asst & Sec Science)	Associate's		1	\$7,200	2.53		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Legal Assistant/Paralegal	Associate's		8	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Legal Assistant/Paralegal	Associate's		4	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Legal Assistant/Paralegal	Certificates		3	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's		10	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's		12	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's	1	10	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's		1	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	Associate's	2	31	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	4 Year & Associate's	1	16	\$9,624	3.38	N/A	Yes N, S	Yes	Yes	93%	---
Erie	PA State University-Penn State Erie-Behrend College	Public, 4-year or above	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies - Criminal Justice	Certificate Associate's	0	7	\$10,446	3.67		Yes (Full)	Yes	Selective - 68% No	72.50%	
Crawford	Crawford County Area Vocational Technical School Practical Nursing Program	Private for-profit, 2-yearPublic, less-than 2-year	Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training	Certificates	1	25	\$10,000	3.07	14.00 per hour	Yes (Full)		No - pre-test and accept top 30 applicants	75%	87.20%

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training	Certificates	1	65	\$20,364	\$2,850 7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	*Mercer County Career Center	Private for-profit, 2-year Public, less-than 2-year	Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training	N/A Certificates		60	\$9,000	3.16	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A
Venango	Venango County Area Vocational Technical School	Private for-profit, 2-year Public, less-than 2-year	Licensed Practical/Vocational Nurse Training	Certificates	1	27	\$8,950	3.14	N/A	Yes ?	Yes	No	85%	85%
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Management Information Systems, General	Associate's		2	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Manufacturing Technology/Technician	AET Associate's	1	5	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Marketing/Marketing Management, General	Associate's		16	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Marketing/Marketing Management, General	BA Associate's	1	31	\$12,000	4.21	\$12 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Massage Therapy/Therapeutic Massage	(Diploma) Certificates	1	37	\$9,500	\$2,850 3.33	\$10 - \$30 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Erie	Triangle Tech Inc-Erie	Private for profit, 2-year	Mechanical Drafting and Mechanical Drafting CAD/CADD	Associate's		8	\$12,263	4.30		Yes		No	97%	
Erie	PA State University-Penn State Erie-Behrend College	Public, 4-year or above	Mechanical Engineering/Mechanical Technology/Technician	Associate's	0	6	\$10,446	3.67		Yes (Full)	Yes	No	72.50%	
Mercer	*Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Mechanical Engineering/Mechanical Technology/Technician	Associate's		3	\$9,624	3.38		Yes		No	93%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary	Associate's		7	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary	(Diploma) Certificates	1	28	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary	Associate's	1	0	\$18,000	6.32	\$9 per hour	Yes		No		

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Medical Assistant	Associate's		17	\$12,740	4.47	\$12 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Medical Insurance Coding Specialist/Coder	Certificates	1	6	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Office Assistant/Specialist	Associate's	1	11	\$18,000	6.32	\$10 per hour	Yes		No		
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Office Management/Administration	Certificates		1	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Office Management/Administration (Combined with Adm Asst & Sec Science)	Associate's		10	\$7,200	2.53		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Medical Radiologic Technology/Science - Radiation Therapist	Associate's		10	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Associate's	1	14	\$12,000	4.21	\$9 - \$12 hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Associate's		2	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Certificates		1	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Certificates	1	2	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Business Institute of Pennsylvania	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist	Certificates	1	1	\$18,000	6.32	\$9 per hour	Yes		No		
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical/Clinical Assistant	Associate's		21	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical/Clinical Assistant	(Diploma) Certificates	1	69	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Venango	Du Bois Business College	Private for-profit, 2-year	Medical/Clinical Assistant	Associates	1	4	\$17,500	\$2,850 6.14		Nationally (Full)	Yes	Yes		100%
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Mental and Social Health Services and Allied Professions, Other	Associate's	1	4	\$6,616	2.32		Yes (Full)	Yes	No HS Grad or GED	81%	
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Nail Technician/Specialist and Manicurist	(Diploma) Certificates	1	11	\$9,500	3.33	\$10 - \$12 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Nurse/Nursing Assistant/Aide and Patient Care Assistant	Certificates		34	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN)	Associate's	2	57	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Sharon Regional Health System School of Nursing	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN)	Certificates		17	NA	?		Yes		No	No first year students	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Clarion	Clarion University of PA	Public, not for-profit, 4-year or above	Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN) (Combined with Allied Health and Medical)	Associate's		48	\$6,616	2.32		Yes		No	81%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Nursing/Registered Nurse (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN), Practical Nursing	Associate's		32	\$11,400	4.00	\$24 - \$28 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Office Management and Supervision	Associate's	1	5	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Paralegal	Associate's	1	14	\$12,000	4.21	\$10 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Pharmacy Technician/Assistant	(Diploma) Certificates	1	34	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Physical Therapist Assistant	Associate's		10	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Physical Therapist Assistant	Certificates		9	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Mercyhurst College	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Physical Therapist Assistant	Associate's	1	10	\$20,364	7.15	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes-from other accredited schools	No	95% accepted - 35% of these enroll	
Mercer	Pennsylvania State University-Penn State Shenango	Public, 4-year or above (Bachelor's degree Associate's degree)	Physical Therapist Assistant	Associate's		16	\$9,624	3.38		Yes		No	93%	
Crawford	Precision Manufacturing Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Certificates			1	\$5,725 to \$19,875	2.01 to 6.97		N/A		N/A	N/A	
			Plastics Engineering Technology/Technician										N/A	
Erie	PA State University-Penn State Erie-Behrend College	Public, 4-year or above	Plastics Engineering Technology/Technician	Associate's	0	3	\$10,446	3.67		Yes (Full)	Yes	No	72.50%	
Crawford	Precision Manufacturing Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Precision Production, Other	Certificates		22	\$5,725 to \$19,875	2.01 to 6.97		N/A		N/A	N/A	
Crawford	Precision Manufacturing Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Quality Control Technology/Technician	Certificates		2	\$5,725 to \$19,875	2.01 to 6.97		N/A		N/A	N/A	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
								\$2,850						
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Respiratory Care Therapy/Therapist	Associate's		8	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Retailing and Retail Operations	Certificates		1	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Secretarial Science, General	Associate's		9	\$12,900	4.53	\$14-\$18 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		
Crawford	University of Pittsburgh-Titusville	Public, 2-year	Social Sciences, Other	Associate's		4	\$8,838	3.10	N/A	Yes (Full)	Yes	No	90%	N/A
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Social Work	BA & Associate's	1, 1	7	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	
Erie	Edinboro University of PA	Public, for profit, 4-year or above	Special Education and Teaching, General	BA & Associate's	1, 1	6	State Resident: \$5038 / With Room & Board \$12,202 \$6484	1.77		Yes (Full)		Yes	69%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Surgical Technology/Technologist	(Diploma) Certificates	1	21	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Crawford	Precision Manufacturing Institute	Private not-for-profit, less than 2-year	Tool and Die Technology/Technician	Certificates		6	\$5,725 to \$19,875	2.01 to 6.97		N/A		N/A	N/A	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Tourism and Travel Services Management	Associate's		6	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Erie Business Center	Private for-profit, 2-year	Tourism and Travel Services Management	Certificates		1	\$8,140	2.86		Yes		No	99%	
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Trade and Industrial Teacher Education	(Diploma) Certificates	1	12	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Erie	Great Lakes Institute of Technology	Private for-profit, 2-year	Veterinary/Animal Health Technology/Technician/Veterinary Assistant	(Diploma) Certificates	1	12	\$9,500	3.33	\$8 - \$10 per hour	Yes (Full)	No	(Must have GED Entrance Exam) Yes	---	85-100%
Erie	Gannon University	Private not for-profit, 4-year or above	Web/Multimedia Management and Webmaster	Certificates		1	\$20,586	7.22		Yes		No	84%	

County	Training Provider	Types of Institutions	Program	Awards / Degrees (conferred between July 1, 2005 and June 30, 2006)	No. of Programs Offered	Total Graduates	Tuition & fees 2006-2007	Ratio of Tuition & Fees to Avg. Community College	Average Wage Earned	Accredited (Full/Provisional)	Course Credit Agreements	Open Admission	% of Applicants Admitted	Rates of completion for Certification Programs
Erie	Tri-State Business Institute	Public, 4-year or above	Welding Technology/ Welding Fab Assoc.	Diploma / Degree	1, 1	42	\$7,395 / \$14,000	2.59	\$18 - 26 per hour/ \$18 - 30 per hour	Yes	Edinboro Accept all Associate Degree; Lockhaven, Slippery Rock; IUP limited	Yes		

7. ENDNOTES

¹ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy: ERIE, 2007, p. 15.

² 2005 American Community Survey, issued August 2006.

http://www.census.gov/acs/www/2005_acs_data_briefs.htm .

³ See the Educational Attainment table in the Appendices. Data for most counties comes from the 2005 American Community Survey except where indicated.

⁴ Northwest Pennsylvania Lake Erie Region, State of the Region: Update 2003. NW PA WIB, 2004.

⁵ Illinois Community College Board at www.iccb.org.

⁶ Illinois Community College Board at www.iccb.org.

⁷ Robison and Chistophersen, 2004: The Socioeconomic Benefits Generated by Metropolitan Community College.

⁸ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy.

⁹ Act 484, Statutes of 1963.

¹⁰ Act 484, Statutes of 1963.

¹¹ See "Inventory of Reports" in the Appendices.

¹² Statement of Diane Bosak, Executive Director, Pennsylvania Commission for Community Colleges, before the House Education Committee, May 10, 2007 in Erie, PA in re: Technical College programs (House Bill 965).

¹³ Investing in Pennsylvania's Families: Economic Opportunity for All (2007) Pathways PA and The Keystone Research Center.

¹⁴ "Talking Points," *The High Cost of Poverty: It Affects Us All*, Presented to Erie Growth Partnership, September 27, 2007, Amy Cuzzola-Kern, Ph.D.. Study was completed April 2007.

¹⁵ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy: ERIE, 2007, p. 13.

¹⁶ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy: ERIE, 2007.

¹⁷ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy: ERIE, 2007, p. 15.

¹⁸ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy: ERIE, 2007.

¹⁹ From The High Cost of Poverty: It Affects Us All, Community Connections, ECF 2007.

²⁰ From The High Cost of Poverty: It Affects Us All, Community Connections, ECF 2007

²¹ 2005 American Community Survey, issued August 2006.

http://www.census.gov/acs/www/2005_acs_data_briefs.htm .

²² See the Educational Attainment table in the Appendices. Data for most counties comes from the 2005 American Community Survey except where indicated.

²³ A Report on the Educational Attainment of Erie City's Population 25 Years and Older as Reported in the 2000 Census and the Implications of Data for the creation of an Erie County Community College. Prepared for Erie County Mark DiVecchio, July 27, 2007.

²⁴ Northwest Pennsylvania Lake Erie Region, State of the Region: Update 2003. NW PA WIB, 2004.

²⁵ Northwest Pennsylvania Lake Erie Region, State of the Region: Update 2003. NW PA WIB, 2004.

²⁶ Illinois Community College Board at www.iccb.org.

²⁷ Illinois Community College Board at www.iccb.org.

²⁸ Illinois Community College Board at www.iccb.org.

²⁹ Robison and Chistophersen, 2004: The Socioeconomic Benefits Generated by Metropolitan Community College.

³⁰ The ERIE Guide to the Erie Economy.

³¹ See "Gaps Analysis Steering Committee Progress Report", June 2007, pp. 3-4.

³² For a summary of the Committee’s activities leading up to the July Progress Report, please see the Appendices.

³³ Jim Ryan, member of Gaps Analysis Steering Committee.

³⁴ Interview with Sandra Edmunds, Director, Office of Access Initiatives, and Mike Dotts, Pennsylvania Department of Education, September 21, 2007.

³⁵ Comments from Aldo Jackson, TITLE, per email dated September 19, 2007 from Sandra Myers.

³⁶ Interview with Sandra Edmunds, Director, Office of Access Initiatives, and Mike Dotts, Pennsylvania Department of Education, September 21, 2007.

³⁷ Comments from Aldo Jackson, TITLE, per email dated September 19, 2007 from Sandra Myers.

³⁸ Aldo Jackson provided the following comment with regards to the Branch Campus models’ impact as an economic development tool:

“In terms of economic development, this option does provide an interesting opportunity if it were coupled with the stand-alone option. The unique opportunity is a public-public partnership in the sponsorship of the community college. Public schools provide the bricks and mortar (and anything else the State will accept). The county governments provide some form of cash infusion—either through county tax levies or gaming revenues.”

In addition, he comments that: “Depending on the scope of the community college operation, and coupled with the in-kind contributions from the 40 school districts, there should be minimal concern with establishing the local share of the revenue.”

³⁹ Figures provided by Aldo Jackson in email dated September 19, 2007 from Sandra Myers. Italicized comments added by Sidney Hacker.

⁴⁰ Interview with Sandra Edmunds, Director, Office of Access Initiatives, Pennsylvania Department of Education, September 21, 2007. Also, see Article XIX-A. Community Colleges (Art. added July 1, 1985, P.L. 103, No. 31).

⁴¹ American Association of Community Colleges, <http://www.aacc.nche.edu/> accessed October 10, 2007.

⁴² Erie Community College Meeting, Erie Club, Erie, PA, November 30, 2006, notes page 7.